Audit Report

OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL

NONINSTRUCTIONAL MILITARY POSITIONS AT THE UNITED STATES MILITARY ACADEMY

Report No. 94-005 October 15, 1993

Department of Defense

Acronyms

ACCS	Automated Communications Computer Systems
DOIM	Directorate of Information Management
GAO	General Accounting Office
NCO	Noncommissioned Officer
OSD	Office of the Secretary of Defense
PAO	Public Affairs Office
STAS	Stewart Army Subpost
TAC NCO	Tactical Noncommissioned Officer
VI/ADS	Visual Information/Audio Documentation Systems Specialist

INSPECTOR GENERAL
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE
400 ARMY NAVY DRIVE
ARLINGTON, VIRGINIA 22202-2884

October 15, 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR INSPECTOR GENERAL, DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY

SUBJECT: Audit Report on Noninstructional Military Positions at the United States Military Academy (Report No. 94-005)

We are providing this final report for your information and use. It discusses the use of noninstructional military personnel at the United States Military Academy. We made the audit at the direction of the Senate Committee on Armed Services.

A draft of this report was provided to the Department of the Army for comment on August 11, 1993. Comments were received from the Department of the Army on September 8, 1993. The timely response to the draft report, to facilitate compliance with the congressional tasking, is appreciated. The Army did not agree to the full extent of the recommended reductions in and conversions of military billets or with the potential monetary benefits reported in the draft of this report. Also, the Army did not respond to Recommendation 2. concerning the funding of civilian pay.

We agree with retaining some, but not most, of the billets that the Army comments state should be retained as military positions and have adjusted the report to that extent. Additional information explaining the audit position is provided in the Audit Response sections in Part II of the report. With respect to the potential monetary benefits from converting positions from military to civilian, we agree with the Army that there are several factors that will impact the actual savings. However, for purposes of this present period estimate, we believe the use of the rates published by the Comptroller of the Department of Defense, as described in the Audit Response section of the report, to be a reasonable basis. In view of the revisions made to the report and the additional information provided in the Audit Response sections of the report, we request the Department of the Army to reconsider its position and provide comments on this final report.

DoD Directive 7650.3 requires that all recommendations be resolved promptly. The specific requirements to be addressed in your comments on this final report are discussed at the end of the finding. Recommendations and monetary benefits are subject to resolution in accordance with DoD Directive 7650.3 in the event of nonconcurrence or failure to comment. Your comments are requested to be provided by December 14, 1993.

The courtesies extended to the audit staff are appreciated. If you have any questions on this audit, please contact Mr. Harlan M. Geyer at (703) 692-2830 (DSN 222-2830) or Ms. Geraldine M. Edwards at (703) 692-2838 (DSN 222-2838). The distribution of this report is listed in Appendix K.

Robert J. Lieberman

Robert J. Lieberman
Assistant Inspector General
for Auditing

Office of the Inspector General, DoD

Report No. 94-005 October 15, 1993
(Project No. 3RA-0001.02)

NONINSTRUCTIONAL MILITARY POSITIONS AT THE UNITED STATES MILITARY ACADEMY

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction. Fiscal restraints caused by a declining Defense budget and the overall downsizing of the U.S. military force structure has prompted Congress to mandate that the Military Academy reduce the Corps of Cadets from 4,400 to 4,000 by 1995. Reducing and reorganizing the Military Academy support staff commensurate with a smaller Corps of Cadets is also necessary.

Objective. The Senate Committee on Armed Services directed that the Inspector General, DoD, conduct an audit of the noninstructional military positions at the United States Military Academy (Academy) to determine which positions are directly involved either in the administration of students and faculty or in the maintenance of facilities.

Audit Results. The number of authorized military billets at the Academy was overstated by 99 billets. Forty-three noninstructional billets at the Academy were not essential either for the accomplishment of the Academy's mission or for the maintenance of the quality of life of the Corps of Cadets. Additionally, another 56 billets were unnecessarily classified as military positions.

Internal Controls. Because the audit was limited to the matters stated in the congressional tasking, we did not assess internal controls.

Potential Benefits of Audit. Implementation of the recommendations will provide potential monetary benefits of $2.7 million per year or $16.3 million during the execution of the FY 1994 through FY 1999 Future Years Defense Program. Further, military personnel will be available for reassignment to more appropriate functions within the Army without affecting the mission of the Military Academy or the maintenance of the quality of life (see Appendixes G, H, and I).

Summary of Recommendations. We recommended that the Superintendent, United States Military Academy, delete 43 noninstructional military billets and convert 56 noninstructional military billets to civilian billets on the staffing document of the Academy. We also recommended that the Chief of Staff, Department of the Army, provide operation and maintenance funding needed for civilian pay when the military billets are converted to civilian.

Management Comments. The Department of the Army partially concurred with Recommendation 1.a. to reduce authorizations and partially concurred with Recommendation 1.b. to convert military billets to civilian. The Army did not provide comments on Recommendation 2. to provide operation and maintenance funding to pay for civilian conversion. The Army nonconcurred with the monetary benefits stating that the conversions would cost more initially and that more operation and maintenance funds will be required to effect the recommended conversions. Details on the management comments are in Part II of the report, and the full text of the management comments are in Part IV.

Audit Response. We maintain that most of the billet reductions and conversions recommended in the draft report are still warranted. We also believe that the monetary benefits, that were computed based on FY 1992 Military-Civilian Equivalent Pay Rates for the Army, published by the Comptroller of the Department of Defense, are reasonably estimated at this time. The actual monetary benefits from conversion will depend on the classification of the civilian grades for the position and on the military and civilian pay rates in effect. Those benefits will be determined and tracked in the audit followup process prescribed in DoD Directive 7650.3 at the time the positions are converted from military to civilian. The Department of the Army is requested to provide comments on the unresolved issues regarding position conversions and deletions and monetary benefits in response to this final report.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary i

Part I - Introduction 1

Background 2
Objective 3
Scope 3
Prior Audits and Other Reviews 4
Other Matters of Interest 4

Part II - Finding and Recommendations 7

Noninstructional Military Personnel Billets 8

Part III - Additional Information 21

Appendix A. Organizations at West Point 22
Appendix B. Congressional Tasking 23
Appendix C. Billets Identified for Deletion by the Academy 25
Appendix D. Noninstructional Billets Identified for Reclassification by the Academy 26
Appendix E. Additional Billets Identified for Deletion by the Audit 28
Appendix F. Additional Billets Identified for Reclassification by the Audit 29
Appendix G. Potential Monetary Benefits During the Execution of the Future Years Defense Program 31
Appendix H. Potential Monetary Benefits of Conversions 32
Appendix I. Summary of Potential Benefits Resulting from Audit 33
Appendix J. Organizations Visited or Contacted 34
Appendix K. Report Distribution 35

Part IV - Management Comments 37

Department of the Army 38

This report was prepared by the Readiness and Operational Support Directorate, Office of the Assistant Inspector General for Auditing, DoD. Copies of the report can be obtained from the Secondary Reports Distribution Unit, Audit Planning and Technical Support Directorate (703) 614-6303 (DSN 224-6303).

Part I - Introduction

Background

Mission. The United States Military Academy (Academy) plays a key role in providing leadership for the United States Army. The Academy provides academic instruction leading to a bachelor's degree, military instruction and training, and physical training to the Corps of Cadets, which had about 4,400 cadets at the time of the audit. The Academy provides about 20 percent of the Army's basic branch second lieutenants and more than 50 percent of the Army's officer accessions having essential backgrounds in mathematics, science, and engineering. As of October 1, 1992, the Academy was authorized 1,041 officer and enlisted personnel to carry out its mission. The mission of the Academy is to:

> ...educate and train the Corps of Cadets so that each graduate shall have the attributes essential to professional growth throughout a career as an officer of the regular army and to inspire each to a lifetime of service to the nation.

Responsibilities. The Academy is under the command of the Superintendent, United States Military Academy (the Superintendent). The Superintendent is subordinate to the Chief of Staff, Headquarters, Department of the Army, who provides oversight of the Academy's operations. Within Army Headquarters, the Assistant Secretary of the Army, Financial Management, provides budget formulation and execution oversight for the Academy. The Deputy Chief of Staff for Personnel has primary responsibility for allocating and validating the Academy's staffing authorizations. In addition, the Academy has a Board of Visitors, which provides oversight of the academic programs, fiscal affairs, state of morale and discipline, and other matters relating to the Academy. The Academy Superintendent, however, retains the primary responsibility and authority for managing the Academy's allocated staffing authorizations.

West Point. As the oldest, continually occupied military post in the country, West Point is a national historic landmark that supports a military and civilian community of about 32,000. In addition to being a college campus with academic, social, and athletic activities, the Academy is also the primary organization located on the West Point Military Installation. The Superintendent of the Academy also commands the West Point Installation.

The West Point Installation's mission is to support the West Point community of cadets, military and civilian employees, family members, and retirees and to maintain the environment for the quality of life for all members of the community as well as the many visitors to the historical site. The military community supported by West Point extends beyond the Academy. Tenant activities are located at West Point that do not contribute to the mission of the Academy or the Installation. The military population of the Academy and West Point is shown in Appendix A.

Objective

The objective of the audit was to determine which noninstructional military staff positions at the Academy are essential for the accomplishment of the mission of the Academy or for the maintenance of the quality of life for the Corps of Cadets. An extract from the "National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 1993" pertaining to this objective is provided in Appendix B.

Scope

The audit evaluated which noninstructional military staff positions at the Academy were essential. We also evaluated whether the essential noninstructional positions could be filled by civilian, rather than military personnel, without affecting the accomplishment of the mission of the Academy or the maintenance of the quality of life for the Corps of Cadets. We did not review any positions that were not assigned to the Academy on its authorization document. We also did not review positions authorized for the Academy Band or the Academy Preparatory School. The band is being downsized through attrition from 99 enlisted authorizations to 79. The Preparatory School is being studied by the Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense (Force Management and Personnel) as recommended in General Accounting Office Report No. NSIAD 92-57 (Office of the Secretary of Defense [OSD] Case No. 8928), "DoD Service Academies: Academy Preparatory Schools Need a Clearer Mission and Better Oversight," March 13, 1992.

To determine the billets to be evaluated, we reviewed the Academy's staffing documentation as of October 30, 1992. We reviewed and analyzed duties and responsibilities, position descriptions, supporting documentation, and mission and function statements for functional areas. We identified 533 of the 1,041 authorized billets as authorized noninstructional military staff positions (see Table 1.). We interviewed 314 of the personnel who either occupied the 533 billets or supervised the personnel in those billets.

Table 1. Academy Military Personnel

	Total Authorizations			Noninstructional Billets		
Activity	Officer	Enlisted	Total	Officer	Enlisted	Total
Office of the Dean	483	20	503	37	9	46
Commandant of Cadets	113	50	163	67	45	112
Garrison Commander	38	256	294	38	256	294
Command Support	55	26	81	55	26	81
Totals	689	352	1,041	197	336	533

The audit was made from October 1992 through May 1993 at the activities listed in Appendix J. This economy and efficiency audit was made in accordance with auditing standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States as implemented by the Inspector General, DoD.

Prior Audits and Other Reviews

In October 1989, the Senate Armed Services Committee requested that the General Accounting Office (GAO) conduct an audit of the military academies. As a result of its review, the GAO issued reports indicating that efficiencies could be attained in the operations at the academies. Report No. GAO/T-NSIAD-90-28 (OSD Case No. 8294), "Review of the Cost and Operations of DoD's Service Academies," April 4, 1990, and Report No. GAO/NSIAD-91-79 (OSD Case No. 8585), "DoD Service Academies: Improved Cost and Performance Monitoring Needed," July 16, 1991, discuss the need for OSD oversight of the academies' operations. The GAO recommended that the Secretary of Defense evaluate alternative means of providing oversight.

Other Matters of Interest

In 1990, the Academy initiated staffing changes to comply with congressional and Department of the Army mandated downsizing. The staffing changes, which are being implemented in two phases, are designed to increase operating efficiencies and reduce military presence by eliminating nonessential positions, converting military staff to civilian staff, and divesting the Academy of the Stewart Army Subpost. The Academy's initiatives for reducing military positions and converting to civilian positions are discussed below.

Academy Initiated Staffing Changes. The Academy had identified 44 military positions for elimination in FYs 1993 through 1996. The positions and the fiscal years in which they will be eliminated are listed in Appendix C. Additionally, as part of a continuing effort to convert military positions to civilian, the Academy had identified 84 positions for conversion to civilian staffing. Of the 84 positions, 46 are noninstructional. A list of those positions is in Appendix D.

Stewart Army Subpost Divestiture. In September 1992, the Academy initiated action to withdraw from Stewart Army Subpost (STAS) by 2000. STAS has been a part of the Academy since 1971, when it was obtained from the U. S. Air Force to alleviate an Academy shortage of staff and faculty housing. Located 17 miles from the Academy's main campus, STAS occupies 402 acres and is comprised of 100 buildings that accommodate a variety of military and civilian tenant activities. The Academy has 40 military personnel working at STAS and 221 military personnel housed there. Operations at STAS

are not considered essential to the Academy's mission. However, the Academy is responsible for providing installation-level support to the various military and civilian personnel assigned to STAS. Accordingly, the Academy spends about $5 million a year to support a staff structure that duplicates many of the services already provided at the Academy's main campus. For example, law enforcement, engineering support, child care, medical services, a chaplain office, and a post exchange are provided at both locations. Divestiture of STAS and consolidation of those support services at the Academy could save about $5 million associated with STAS operations. On April 16, 1993, the Academy Superintendent approved the STAS divestiture, and final approval from Headquarters, Department of the Army, is pending. A list of STAS tenant activities and assigned personnel is in Appendix A.

Part II - Finding and Recommendations

Noninstructional Military Personnel Billets

The need for military personnel at the Academy was overstated. Forty-three authorized noninstructional military billets were not essential for the accomplishment of the Academy's mission or for the maintenance of the quality of life of the Corps of Cadets. Another 56 noninstructional billets were classified as military positions, although needed skills and duties did not support the classification. Academy officials did not identify the 43 positions for deletion because management officials believed they had a valid need for the positions and that their staffing procedures were within Department of the Army personnel management guidelines. Academy officials did not identify the 56 positions for conversion to civilian because they believed only military personnel could satisfy the need to work long duty hours, possessed the needed educational background, and provided innovative technologies to the Academy. If the positions are deleted or converted, funds totaling $2.7 million per year or $16.3 million during the execution of the FY 1994 through FY 1999 Future Years Defense Program could be put to better use and 99 military personnel could be reassigned to more essential functions within the Army.

Background

Academy operations are divided among the following organizational elements.

o Office of the Superintendent provides policy and direction to all Academy elements.

o Dean of the Academic Board provides policy and supervises the academic program.

o Commandant of Cadets supervises the military, physical, and professional development programs for the Corps of Cadets.

o Garrison Commander serves as the Superintendent's primary agent for the management of the West Point Installation and directs and supervises the day-to-day operations of the Installation, including engineering and housing, contracting, logistics, information management, security, and community and family activities.

o Director of Intercollegiate Athletics provides intercollegiate and intramural athletic programs.

o Director of Admissions executes the Academy's admissions procedures and maintains candidate records.

o Command Support Organizations assist the Superintendent in accomplishing the Academy's mission. Functions include the Chief of Staff; Internal Review; Chaplain; Inspector General; Staff Judge Advocate; Directorate of Resources Management; and Directorate of Operations, Plans, and Security.

Military billet authorizations for the Academy are identified on the standard Table of Distribution and Allowances. Army Regulation 570-4, "Manpower Management," September 25, 1989, prescribes policies, procedures, guidelines, and controls for managing personnel resources. The guidance requires that staffing levels be based on a realistic analysis of work to be done and that the work be essential to accomplishing the mission of the activity. Army Regulation 570-4 also requires that civilian personnel be used in positions that do not require military incumbents for reasons of law, training, security, discipline, rotation, or combat readiness; do not require a military background for successful performance of the duties involved; and do not entail unusual hours not normally associated or compatible with civilian employment.

OSD and Army staffing policy dictates that staffing will be at the minimum level necessary to meet objectives. Also, congressional interest in the Academy's operating efficiency and in the military staffing needed to support the Academy's operations has focused attention on the Academy's noninstructional staffing requirements.

Billets Identified for Deletion

As of the time of the audit, the Academy had identified nonessential positions within its organizational structure. The 44 military positions identified for elimination between FY 1993 and FY 1996 are shown in Appendix C.

We determined that an additional 43 noninstructional positions at the Academy could be eliminated without adversely affecting the Academy's mission. To determine whether those positions were essential, we reviewed organization, mission, and function statements for the various departments at the Academy, reviewed duties and responsibilities of noninstructional military positions, and interviewed incumbents. Twenty-one positions are located in the Office of the Commandant of Cadets, 20 positions are in the Office of the Dean, and 1 position each is located in the Office of the Superintendent and the Public Affairs Office. The billets are identified in Appendix E and are discussed in the paragraphs below. The eliminated positions will result in potential monetary benefits of $2.5 million per year or $15.2 million during execution of the Future Years Defense Program (see Appendix G).

Office of the Commandant of Cadets. The Office of the Commandant of Cadets is responsible for developing in each cadet the qualities and attributes of leadership by emphasizing moral, ethical, and social development; a physical education program requiring the highest standards of physical fitness; and a broad basic military education and orientation for a career in the

U.S. Army. The Office of the Commandant of Cadets was authorized 163 billets with various position descriptions, designated grades, and military occupations.

Brigade Tactical Department. The Brigade Tactical Department provides the military supervision for the brigade staff and the Corps of Cadets. The Corps of Cadets is organized into four regiments under the brigade staff. Each regiment has 9 companies with about 120 cadets in each company. Each company is headed by a tactical officer who provides supervision and leadership development for the cadets. The tactical officer observes and evaluates cadets in academic, physical, military, moral, and ethical development. Each company also has a tactical noncommissioned officer (TAC NCO) who assists the tactical officer in observing and evaluating the cadets and who serves as a role model and mentor for cadets holding NCO rank in the Corps. The staffing at the company level was increased in September 1992 when the Superintendent approved the reallocation of 23 enlisted positions from other Academy departments to the Brigade Tactical Department. The reallocation increased the number of TAC NCOs to 36, or 1 per company.

Of the 21 positions we determined could be eliminated in the Office of the Commandant of Cadets, 20 are TAC NCO positions assigned to the Brigade Tactical Department. In determining that the 20 TAC NCOs were not essential, we considered that the increase in staffing was not correlated to an increase in the work load of the regiments and that the NCOs did not have duties separate from the tactical officers they assisted. The reduction of 20 positions would allow the department to be staffed with 4 TAC NCOs per regiment and in our opinion, would not adversely affect the Academy's mission of developing cadet leadership.

Academy officials stated that the increased NCO presence in the tactical chain provides the necessary degree of reality of Army life to the Corps of Cadets and eases the transition to leadership positions in the regular Army. Although the Academy's reasons for the increased presence of NCOs are valid, we believe the Academy can use existing officer and enlisted personnel to teach and instill in the cadets the role of the senior enlisted personnel. In addition, the Academy's military instruction and training programs also provide cadets an opportunity to learn and appreciate the role of the senior enlisted personnel.

Personnel and Administrative Specialist. The function of the Office of Personnel and Administration within the Office of the Commandant of Cadets is to provide military personnel management for the Corps of Cadets. The Academy had never filled the position of Administrative Specialist, and the duties were performed by existing staff. The Academy has an Adjutant General function at installation-level with the same personnel management responsibilities, but for military personnel other than cadets assigned to the Academy. We believe that the personnel management functions could be consolidated without adversely affecting the Academy's mission.

Office of the Dean. The Office of the Dean is responsible for providing a broad collegiate education in the arts and sciences leading to a Bachelor of Science degree and for developing the cadets' skills in analyzing, problem

solving, and decision making on major issues confronting society, the nation, and the professional soldier. The Office of the Dean was authorized 503 billets with various descriptions, designated grades, and military occupations. We determined that 20 positions in the Office of the Dean were not essential to either the Academy's mission or the quality of life of the Corps of Cadets. Those positions were assigned to "Centers of Excellence" whose primary mission is research and research-related work for various organizations within the Department of Defense and Headquarters, Department of the Army. Each center has its own mission. For example, the primary mission of the Center for Artificial Intelligence Analysis and Evaluation is to promote exploitation of artificial intelligence technologies by active Army units. The Center's funding is from the U.S. Army Artificial Intelligence Center at the Pentagon and the U.S. Army Information Systems Command at Fort Huachuca. Another example is the Photonics Research Center, which performs basic and applied research in laser-related technologies. The Academy indirectly benefits from many of the research efforts. Benefits include research opportunities for permanent and rotating faculty and the availability of personnel from the centers to provide seminars and offer expert advise. However, we concluded that although the centers may provide a useful research capability for the Army, the centers were not essential to the Academy's basic mission.

Office of the Superintendent. The Office of the Superintendent commands all elements of the Academy and the West Point Installation and is responsible for formulating and executing policies, procedures, and programs required to accomplish the mission of the Academy. Six billets with various descriptions, designated grades, and military occupations were authorized for the Office of the Superintendent. We believe that within the Office of the Superintendent, the position of chauffeur is not essential to the Academy's mission or to the quality of life of the Corps of Cadets. Although Army regulations allow installation commanders authorizations for personal staff, we determined that the duties performed by the chauffeur did not warrant assigning a full-time military member to the position. In addition to the chauffeur, the Superintendent had three other enlisted aides who could, if necessary, act as chauffeur for the Superintendent.

Public Affairs Office. The Public Affairs Office (PAO) is responsible for gathering, processing, and disseminating information on the Academy to the cadets, staff and faculty, the general public, and the news media. Ten billets with various descriptions, designated grades, and military occupations were authorized for the PAO. We determined that one of six authorized journalist positions in the PAO was not essential. An analysis of the duties and functions performed in the PAO showed that five journalists performed similar duties and that their work load was limited. Duties included writing and editing articles, photography, and layout work. The work load for each position consisted of one to three articles per week. PAO personnel were concerned that eliminating any positions would limit coverage in photography and written articles. We considered the Academy's position, but concluded that the remaining staff could provide needed reporting coverage.

Billets Identified for Civilian Conversion

As of September 1992, the Academy had an initiative under way to identify positions that could be converted to civilian staffing. Efforts completed as of the time of the audit have shown commitment to the Academy's objective of returning soldiers to the field and to using military personnel for duties only military members should do. The Academy's conversion plan identified 84 military positions (see Appendix D) that could be converted between FY 1993 and FY 1996.

After reviewing noninstructional military positions at the Academy and the Academy's conversion plan, we identified an additional 56 positions that could be converted to civilian staffing without adversely affecting the Academy's mission or the maintenance of the quality of life of the Corps of Cadets. The additional positions we identified for civilian conversion are listed in Appendix F. In reviewing positions for possible civilian conversion, we considered the duties and responsibilities of the position and whether unique military knowledge or skill was required to successfully perform the duties. We interviewed incumbents of the positions and their supervisors and examined mission and function statements. We also considered whether the duties and responsibilities of the positions made an incumbent a highly visible and influential role model for cadets.

The authorized noninstructional billets, identified in Appendix F and discussed in the paragraphs below, could be occupied by civilian personnel without degradation to the performance of the Academy's military functions. The conversions could result in potential monetary benefits of $180,396 per year or about $1.1 million during the execution of the FY 1994 through FY 1999 Future Years Defense Program (see Appendix H).

Organizational Structure. The Academy did not identify 16 noninstructional positions for conversion. The positions were located in the offices of the Chaplain; Commandant of Cadets; Directorate of Operations, Plans, and Security; Director of Admissions; Director of Intercollegiate Athletics; and Directorate of Community and Family Activities and in the 1st Battalion, 1st Infantry. The Academy's reason for not converting the 16 positions to civilian was that the positions are typically staffed with military personnel at Army installations. Also, Academy officials stated that potential students, parents, and other visitors to the Academy expect to see military personnel at a military Academy. The Academy's organizational structure closely followed the standard Army organization structure for installation-level activities. That organizational structure resulted in support functions heavily staffed by military personnel. We viewed the Academy as a unique organization within the Army for staffing purposes. Unlike most installations, the Academy does not have a mobilization mission and, therefore, has more flexibility in determining whether positions are staffed with civilian or military personnel.

Office of the Chaplain. The Office of the Chaplain is responsible for planning and executing a comprehensive program that provides for meeting the spiritual and religious needs of all members of the Command and of the faculty,

family members, and cadets assigned to the Academy. Five of seven enlisted Chaplain Assistant positions were identified for civilian conversion by the audit. Academy officials stated that Army Regulation 165-1, "Chaplain Activities in the United States Army," August 31, 1989, requires a Unit Ministry Team to consist of at least one Army Chaplain and one enlisted Chaplain Assistant. According to the Regulation, the Unit Ministry Team is tasked by the commander to respond to the religious and spiritual needs of soldiers and their families. During wartime operations, the Unit Ministry Team attends to the spiritual needs of all soldiers on the battlefield. The duties of the Chaplain Assistants at the Academy do not preclude assigning a civilian. Some duties that would require assigning military personnel would be performed by a Unit Ministry Team that would deploy with its unit during mobilization. Since the Academy does not have a mobilization mission, we concluded that the positions can be converted to civilian without adversely affecting the mission or quality of life at the Academy. Regulation 165-1 states that in peacetime garrison operations, the Unit Ministry Team may be expanded to include team members other than Chaplain and Chaplain Assistant. In fact, the Academy is authorized four civilian Chaplains of which one is the Head Chaplain, appointed by the President of the United States.

Office of the Commandant of Cadets. We determined that two positions in the Office of the Commandant could be converted to civilian. The duties of the Administrative Supervisor for Honor involve administrative and logistics matters, such as coordinating audio-visual equipment needs, making arrangements for meetings and conferences, and maintaining files and records for the honor program. The duties of the Information Management Officer involve supervising a staff of eight civilians in the Information Systems Division within the Office of the Commandant of Cadets, managing automation systems, managing data base access, assisting users in the operation and use of computer networking systems, setting up computer systems to produce completed forms and publications used by the Office of the Commandant of Cadets, and maintaining and distributing publications and regulations. No military skills were required for successful performance of the duties.

Directorate of Operations, Plans, and Security. The Directorate of Operations, Plans, and Security is responsible for planning, coordinating, and executing all Academy-level events; scheduling major activities that do not conflict with activities on the Academy Master Schedule; and directing and supervising operational plans and actions and security and intelligence matters. We determined that three positions in the Directorate of Operations, Plans, and Security did not require military personnel. Duties performed by the Chief, Operations and Scheduling, and the Operations NCO involve planning, coordinating, and supervising the administrative, operational, and logistic support for Academy events, such as graduation, honor guard ceremonies, dedications, cadet-parent weekend, football games, cadet basic training, and cadet field training. The duties of the Administrative Specialist include performing clerical duties, managing equipment, dispatching military vehicles, and assisting in preparing the Academy Master Schedule, which details all Academy events for the academic year. We believe that the duties of the three positions do not justify the assignment of military personnel.

Director of Admissions. The Director of Admissions is responsible for carrying out the Academy's admission policy, recruiting, and maintaining contact with persons interested in attending the Academy, and maintaining records for candidates. Two positions in the Admissions office did not require military staffing. The duties performed by the Executive Officer involve assigning suspense dates and coordinating correspondence and staffing actions between and among the Director of Admissions, Academy staff, Congress, field officers, and educators and supervising the personnel, security, logistics, and resource management functions within the Office of the Director of Admissions. The duties of the Chief, Records and Testing, involve supervising all record maintenance and testing actions for candidates through reporting day, disposing of files, and printing final reports. We determined that the duties could be performed by civilian personnel.

Director of Intercollegiate Athletics. The Director of Intercollegiate Athletics is responsible for all intercollegiate and intramural athletics at the Academy. The duties of the Administrative Services Clerk involve processing all incoming and outgoing mail. The duties of the Unit Supply Specialist involve coordinating the issue and turn in of supplies and equipment between receipt holders and the property book office. We determined that the two positions did not require military skills and could be converted to civilian positions.

Directorate of Community and Family Activities. The Directorate of Community and Family Activities within the Garrison Commander's office advises the Commander and staff on and directs the operation of community and family activities; education services; and morale, welfare, and recreation business operations. The position of Behavioral Science Specialist in the directorate does not require military knowledge or skills. Duties involve clinical counseling of alcohol and drug dependent military and civilian personnel and providing administrative support for the Alcohol Drug Control Officer.

1st Battalion, 1st Infantry. The 1st Battalion, 1st Infantry, is the command element for troop units assigned and attached to the Academy. The troop units and personnel support Academy operations by assisting in the training of cadets and providing security for the West Point Installation. The position of Legal Clerk, in the 1st Battalion, 1st Infantry, could be converted to civilian since the primary duties are administrative and do not require military skills.

Traditional Staffing Practices. We determined that 40 of the 56 noninstructional military positions were not identified for civilian conversion due to the Academy's preference for traditional staffing with military personnel. The positions were located in the Provost Marshall's Office, the Directorate of Information Management, Office of the Adjutant General, and Office of the Staff Judge Advocate. Academy officials cited long duty work hours and graduate-level and on-the-job training provided to military personnel as reasons for not converting positions to civilian.

Provost Marshall's Office. The Provost Marshall's Office provides the law enforcement function, physical and personnel security, crime prevention

support, and honor guard support and services for the Academy. We determined that 19 positions in the Provost Marshall's Office were excluded from conversion because, according to Academy officials, the positions required the incumbents to work 24-hour shifts or evenings and weekends. Officials were concerned that funding would not be available to pay the additional costs for overtime and shift work normally associated with civilian staffing of the positions. Another position was excluded because according to Academy officials, it provided a career progression opportunity for military personnel.

The duties of the 20 positions did not require military-specific knowledge or skills. Duties of Military Police Investigators assigned to the Provost Marshall's Office involve issuing citations, investigating accidents to determine fault, providing traffic control and escorts for football games, and assisting tourists. In addition to the Provost Marshall's Office function, the Academy has a Military Police Company attached to the 1st Battalion, 1st Infantry. The Company is authorized 102 military police. We considered that number of military police sufficient to provide the law enforcement function for the Academy. We did not consider the duties performed by traffic investigators to be of a military or law enforcement nature. In addition, we did not consider duties and responsibilities that called for long duty hours or weekends reasons to retain military classifications for the positions.

Directorate of Information Management. The Directorate of Information Management (DOIM) is responsible for providing automation, visual information, communications, records management, and printing and publication services. The Academy identified all enlisted positions in the DOIM for either conversion or elimination, but did not identify any officer positions for conversion or elimination. Academy officials excluded eight officer positions in the DOIM from civilian conversion because the officials did not believe civilian personnel had access to the same education and training opportunities as military personnel. Based on a review of the duties performed in the DOIM and interviews with incumbent officers, we determined that the eight officer positions could be converted. The eight positions are for division directors and branch chiefs. Our analyses indicated that military knowledge or skill was not necessary for successful performance of the duties.

The Director of Information Management and other Academy officials oppose converting those positions. The reasons provided are that in order for the Academy to keep abreast of the latest technologies available in the information management area, branch chief positions must be filled by officers who have recently completed graduate school and can therefore introduce new and innovative technologies to the Academy. DOIM officials stated that finding qualified civilian personnel in the New York area to fill the positions would be difficult since civilians often do not have the level or type of education desired. We believe that it is not essential to have a rotating military staff of division directors and branch chiefs with masters degrees in the information management field. The successful operation of the DOIM does not depend on whether the positions are staffed by military or civilian personnel. Based on our review,

we concluded that civilian personnel would be fully capable of carrying out the duties and responsibilities of those positions if afforded the same opportunities and training to keep abreast of the latest technology in the information management field.

Office of the Adjutant General. The Office of the Adjutant General is responsible for managing soldier programs and for providing direct military personnel services including retirement, retention, personnel processing, and casualty area command services to all assigned, tenant, and attached units at the Academy. Academy officials excluded six positions in the Office of the Adjutant General from civilian conversion because the officials did not believe civilian personnel had access to the same education and training opportunities as military personnel. The Adjutant General stated that the six positions identified by the auditors for civilian conversion would be difficult to convert because no formal education or training is available for the positions and that the turnover rate for civilians is high. With the exception of the Personnel Management Specialist position, the other positions are Personnel Records and Personnel Action Specialists. Those positions are typically staffed by civilian personnel who are provided on-the-job training. We did not consider turnover rates and the lack of formal training valid reasons to retain military personnel in the positions.

Office of the Staff Judge Advocate. The Office of the Staff Judge Advocate is responsible for providing legal advice to the Superintendent, staff, and all post activities, and for furnishing legal services to the command. Four positions in the Office of the Staff Judge Advocate were staffed with military personnel rather than civilians because the work schedule required evening and weekend work. The four positions did not require military knowledge or skill for successful performance of the duties. Two other positions in the Office of the Staff Judge Advocate were staffed with military personnel rather than civilians because those positions are typically staffed by military personnel at other Army installations and provide career progression opportunities for military personnel. We believe the six positions could be converted to civilian without adversely affecting the Academy's mission.

Conclusion

The need for military personnel at the Academy is overstated. Of the 533 authorized noninstructional military billets at the Academy, 43 noninstructional positions, in addition to the 44 previously identified by the Academy, were not essential for the accomplishment of the mission or for the maintenance of the quality of life of the Corps of Cadets. Another 56 noninstructional billets, in addition to the 84 already identified by the Academy, could be converted to civilian staffing based on the duties and responsibilities of the positions. Implementation of our recommendations should enhance the operation of the Academy and should allow for the

reassignment of military personnel to more essential functions within the Army. A savings of $2.7 million per year or $16.3 million for the 6-year Future Years Defense Program would be realized (see Appendix I).

Recommendations, Management Comments, and Audit Responses

1. We recommend that the Superintendent, United States Military Academy:

a. Reduce the United States Military Academy's authorizations by the 43 positions listed in Appendix E.

Department of the Army Comments. The Army concurred with the reduction of 22 positions and nonconcurred with eliminating the 20 Tactical (TAC) NCO positions, the Chauffeur position, and the Information Management Officer position.

The Army reply cited the need for cadets to have greater exposure to NCOs and the developmental relationship between the cadets and the NCOs. The response also stated that the TAC NCOs provide a critical military instructional function and should not have been included in the scope of the audit since the focus of the audit was noninstructional positions.

In nonconcurring with the reduction of the Chauffeur position, the Army stated that the Chauffeur had additional duties other than driving and that it was not feasible to use other support staff for that function.

The Army nonconcurred with eliminating the Information Management Officer position, stating that the DOIM was not staffed or organized to absorb, replace, or supervise the functions provided by the Information Management Officer position within the Office of the Commandant of Cadets.

Audit Response. We disagree that the TAC NCOs were outside the scope of the audit. The decision was made early in the audit to include Tactical Officer positions as noninstructional since the TAC NCOs provided counseling and mentoring to cadets and did not perform formal instructional duties. We do not take exception to the merit of establishing a developmental relationship between the cadets and the NCOs, and we have not recommended eliminating the TAC NCO presence entirely from the Corps of Cadets. Rather, the recommendation is to reduce the number of TAC NCOs from the current 36 to 16. The Academy's Department of Military Instruction offers several formal courses that include instruction and training in the role of the officer and the NCO. We believe the Academy can supplement the reduced TAC NCO strength by using existing programs to stress the working relationship of the officer and the NCO. We request that the Army reconsider its position on the number of TAC NCOs needed at the Academy.

Although the Chauffeur has other duties as indicated in the response, we believe that other alternatives are available to staffing this function with full-time military personnel. We request that the Army reconsider its position of not eliminating the Chauffeur position.

We reconsidered the elimination of the Information Management Officer position within the Office of the Commandant of Cadets. Based on the duties performed, the position should instead be converted from military to civilian. The applicable appendixes and monetary benefits have been adjusted accordingly. We request that the Army comment on the conversion (included in Recommendation 1.b. in the final report) and revised monetary benefits in response to this report.

b. Reclassify as civilian authorizations, the United States Military Academy's military authorizations for the 56 positions listed in Appendix F.

Department of the Army Comments. The Army concurred with the conversion of 20 military positions to civilian, pointed out an error in one position, and nonconcurred with the conversion of the remaining 35 positions. The Army reply cited evening and weekend work requirements in nonconcurring with converting a total of 23 positions in the Provost Marshall's Office and the Staff Judge Advocate's Office. For the remaining positions, the response reiterated the need to retain the military classifications because of military-unique aspects of the positions, making them unsuitable for conversion to civilian staffing. The Army also nonconcurred with the $16.8 million monetary benefits in the draft report stating that the conversions would cost more initially and that more operation and maintenance funds will be required to effect the recommended conversions.

Audit Response. The recommendation to reclassify military billets to civilian was based on the fact that the duties being performed did not require military knowledge or skills for successful performance. Also, we relied on the criteria in Army Regulation 570-4, "Manpower Management," for determining whether positions should be classified as military or civilian. Information provided in the management comments was discussed in the finding section of the draft report and was considered in making the recommendation. We request that the Army reconsider its position on this recommendation.

The report text and applicable appendixes have been revised to eliminate the Administrative Sergeant position from the list of positions recommended for reclassification to civilian, since the position has already been eliminated from the Academy's authorizations. Monetary benefits have been adjusted accordingly. We maintain, however, that most of the billet eliminations and conversions recommended in the draft report are still warranted. We also believe that the monetary benefits, adjusted to $16.3 million in this final report, that were computed based on FY 1992 Military-Civilian Equivalent Pay Rates for the Army, published by the Comptroller of the Department of Defense, are reasonably estimated at this time. The actual monetary benefits from conversion will depend on the classification of the civilian grades for the position and on the military and civilian pay rates in effect. Those benefits will

be determined and tracked in the audit followup process prescribed in DoD Directive 7650.3 at the time the positions are converted from military to civilian. The Department of the Army is requested to provide comments on the unresolved issues regarding position conversions and deletions and monetary benefits in response to this final report.

2. We recommend that the Chief of Staff, Department of the Army, provide operation and maintenance funding needed for civilian pay when military billets are converted to civilian billets at the United States Military Academy.

The Department of the Army Comments. The Army did not comment on this recommendation in the response to the draft report.

Audit Response. We request that written comments be provided on Recommendation 2. in response to the final report.

Part III - Additional Information

Appendix A. Organizations at West Point

Activity	Military Personnel Authorized Officer	Enlisted
U.S. Military Academy	689	352
Tenant Activities [1]		
U.S. Army Medical Department Activity	100	196
Information Systems Command	2	7
U.S. Army Criminal Investigation Division	2	1
STAS Tenant Activities [1]		
New York Operational Support Airlift	3	5
Readiness Group STAS	31	59
Other STAS Tenants [2]		
Army Reserves/National Guard		
97th U.S. Army Reserve Command Aviation		
320th Evacuation Hospital	Not Available [3]	
U.S. Army Health Services Command		
854th Engineer Battalion		
Other Reserves/National Guard		
4th Marine Air Wing	10	231
New York Air National Guard	32	213
U.S. Air Force Recruiting	5	15

[1] The Academy provides Standard Installation Division Personnel System and personnel support to these units as part of negotiated agreements with the individual tenants. Personnel authorizations for tenant activities are not part of the Academy's authorizations.

[2] These Commands are not part of or subordinate to the Academy.

[3] The Academy has no personnel authorizations for these commands.

Appendix B. Congressional Tasking

102D CONGRESS
2d Session

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

REPORT
102-966

NATIONAL DEFENSE AUTHORIZATION
ACT FOR FISCAL YEAR 1993

CONFERENCE REPORT

TO ACCOMPANY

H.R. 5006

OCTOBER 1, 1992.—Ordered to be printed

U.S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE
WASHINGTON : 1992

59-624

100

extent the Secretary considers proper. Such delegation may be made with or without the authority to make successive redelegations.".

(b) CIVILIAN FACULTY AT AIR FORCE ACADEMY.—Section 9331 of title 10, United States Code, is amended by adding at the end the following new subsection:

"(c)(1) The Secretary of the Air Force may employ as many civilians as professors, instructors, and lecturers at the Academy as the Secretary considers necessary.

"(2) The compensation of persons employed under this subsection shall be as prescribed by the Secretary.

"(3) The Secretary may delegate the authority conferred by this subsection to any person in the Department of the Air Force to the extent the Secretary considers proper. Such delegation may be made with or without the authority to make successive redelegations.".

(c) PROPOSED LEGISLATION TO INCREASE CIVILIAN FACULTY MEMBERS.—Not later than April 1, 1993, the Secretary of Defense shall transmit to the Committees on Armed Services of the Senate and House of Representatives recommended legislation for—

(1) increasing the number of civilians on the faculty at the United States Military Academy and the United States Air Force Academy; and

(2) reducing the number of officers of the Armed Forces assigned or appointed as permanent faculty at the United States Military Academy and the United States Air Force Academy.

SEC. 524. NONINSTRUCTIONAL STAFF AT SERVICE ACADEMIES.

(a) REVIEW OF NONINSTRUCTIONAL STAFF POSITIONS.—The Inspector General of the Department of Defense shall conduct a management audit of the noninstructional staff positions at the United States Military Academy, the United States Naval Academy, and the United States Air Force Academy to determine which positions are absolutely essential for the accomplishment of the mission of these service academies and the maintenance of the quality of life at these service academies.

(b) REPORT ON RESULTS OF REVIEW.—Not later than June 1, 1993, the Secretary of Defense shall submit to Congress a report specifying those actions taken or proposed to be taken as a result of the management audit required by subsection (a).

SEC. 525. AUTHORITY OF UNITED STATES MILITARY ACADEMY TO CONFER THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS IN LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT.

Upon the recommendation of the faculty of the United States Military Academy, the Superintendent of the Academy may confer the degree of master of arts in leadership development upon persons who—

(1) before the date of the enactment of this Act, graduated from the program in leadership development offered at the Academy and fulfilled the requirements for the degree; or

(2) as of that date, are enrolled in the program in leadership development offered at the Academy and subsequently graduate from the program and fulfill the requirements for the degree.

Appendix C. Billets Identified for Deletion by the Academy

Position Number	Position Title	Number	Military Grade	Fiscal Year
002/02	Special Assistant for Strategic Planning	1	Officer-5	1993
025A/06	Military Police	5	Enlisted-3	1995 *
025S/05	Military Police	4	Enlisted-4	1994 *
025S/06	Military Police	3	Enlisted-3	1994
028A/06	Doghandler Explosives	1	Enlisted-6	1994
028A/07	Doghandler Narcotics	1	Enlisted-5	1994
028A/13	Military Police Investigator	1	Enlisted-3	1994
028B/03	Military Police Sign Painter Assistant	1	Enlisted-3	1994
028D/01	Operations NCO, STAS	1	Enlisted-7	*
028D/03	Desk Sergeant	4	Enlisted-6	*
055B/01A	Supply Sergeant	1	Enlisted-7	1994
056D/06	Programmer Analyst	3	Enlisted-3	1994
056E/02	Machine/Console Operator	2	Enlisted-7	1994
056E/03	Machine/Console Operator	2	Enlisted-6	1994
056E/04	Machine/Console Operator	1	Enlisted-5	1995
056E/05	Machine/Console Operator	1	Enlisted-4	1995
057/02	Chief Audio Visual NCO In Charge	1	Enlisted-9	1993
057C/04	Visual Information/Audio Documentation Systems (VI/ADS) Specialist	1	Enlisted-2	1994
057F/02	Senior Documentation Systems Specialist	1	Enlisted-5	1995
057F/03	Still Document Systems Specialist	2	Enlisted-5	1994
057I/02	Broadcast Operations Chief	1	Enlisted-7	1994
057J/02	Senior VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-6	1994
057J/03	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-5	1994
057J/04	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-4	1996
057K/04	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-5	1996
057K/05	VI/ADS Specialist	2	Enlisted-4	1994

* Dependent on the divestiture of Stewart Army Subpost.

Appendix D. Noninstructional Billets Identified for Reclassification by the Academy

Location	Billet Number	Position Title	Number	Military Grade	Fiscal Year
Chief of Staff	004B/04	Protocol Officer	1	Officer-3	1996
	004B/05	Administrative Supervisor	1	Enlisted-6	1995
PAO	021A/03	Reporter/Editor	1	Enlisted-5	1993
	021D/02	Journalist	1	Enlisted-4	1993
Garrison Commander	024/01A	Operations Officer	1	Officer-4	1994
Directorate of Logistics	042/01	Director Logistics	1	Officer-5	1996
	042/03	Supply Sergeant	1	Enlisted-8	1994
DOIM	056A/03	Automated Communications Computer Systems (ACCS) Repairer	1	Enlisted-5	1993
	056D/03	Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-6	1993
	055B/02	Assistant Supply Specialist	1	Enlisted-5	1994
	056A/02A	ACCS Maintenance Technician	1	Enlisted-6	1994
	056D/02	Senior Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-7	1994
	056E/03	Machine Console Operator	2	Enlisted-6	1994
	056E/04	Machine Console Operator	1	Enlisted-5	1994
	057C/01A	Senior VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-6	1994
	057C/02	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-5	1994
	057C/03	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-4	1994
	057C/04	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-3	1994
	057F/04	Still Documentation Specialist	1	Enlisted-4	1994
	057F/04A	Still Documentation Specialist	1	Enlisted-3	1994
	057K/06	Visual Information/Audio Equipment Repairer	1	Enlisted-3	1994
	056D/04	Programmer/Analyst	1	Enlisted-5	1995
	056D/05	Programmer/Analyst	1	Enlisted-4	1995
	056E/05	Machine Console Operator	1	Enlisted-4	1995
	057B/01	Administrative Specialist	1	Enlisted-5	1995
	057C/01	Audio Visual Operations Supervisor	1	Enlisted-7	1995
	056A/02	ACCS Maintenance Chief	1	Enlisted-7	1996
	056A/04	ACCS Repairer	1	Enlisted-4	1996
	056D/02	Senior Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-7	1996
	056E/03	Machine Console Operator	1	Enlisted-6	1996
	057C/03	VI/ADS Specialist	1	Enlisted-4	1996

Appendix D: Noninstructional Billets Identified for Reclassification by the Academy

Location	Billet Number	Position Title	Number	Military Grade	Fiscal Year
Office of the Dean	060B/01A	Plans and Operations Officer	1	Officer-4	1996
	060B/02	Chief Academic Admissions Officer	1	Officer-4	1994
	060B/05	Information Systems Officer	1	Officer-3	1993
	060B/06	Program Analyst	1	Enlisted-5	1993
	060C/03	Engineer Staff Officer	1	Officer-3	1995
	060E/06	Computer Operator	1	Enlisted-7	1993
	060E/09	Instructor-Automated Data Processing	2	Enlisted-6	1993
	060E/09	Instructor-Automated Data Processing	1	Enlisted-6	1994
	060E/09	Instructor-Automated Data Processing	1	Enlisted-6	1995
	060E/11	Program Analyst	1	Enlisted-5	1993
	068/21	Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-6	1994
Office of the Commandant of Cadets	089/01	Director Cadet Activities	1	Officer-6	1994
	089C/01	Director Cadet Programs	1	Officer-4	1996

Appendix E. Additional Billets Identified for Deletion by the Audit

Department	Billet Number	Position Title	Number	Military Grade
Office of the Superintendent	001/07	Chauffeur	1	Enlisted-6
Public Affairs Office	021A/04	Reporter	1	Enlisted-4
Office of the Dean	060E/O2	Director Office of Artificial Intelligence	1	Officer-5
	060E/03	Research Scientist	1	Officer-4
	060E/04	Research Scientist	1	Officer-3
	060E/06	Computer Specialist	1	Enlisted-7
	060G/01	Permanent Associate Professor	3	Officer-5
	060G/02	Research Analyst	3	Officer-4
	060H/01	Director Operations Research Center	1	Officer-5
	060H/02	Operations Research Analyst	3	Officer-3
	072A/01	Director Office of Economic and Manpower Analysis	1	Officer-5
	072A/02	Deputy Director Economic and Manpower Analysis	1	Officer-5
	072A/03	Research Analyst	1	Officer-4
	072A/04	Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-7
	072A/05	Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-7
	072A/06	Programmer Analyst	1	Enlisted-4
Office of the Commandant of Cadets	078A/02A	Administrative Specialist	1	Enlisted-6
	083-086	Tactical NCOs	20	Enlisted-7

Appendix F. Additional Billets Identified for Reclassification by the Audit

Location	Billet Number	Position Title	Number	Military Grade
Office of the Chaplain	006/10	Chaplain Assistant	1	Enlisted-5
	06/11	Chaplain Assistant	1	Enlisted-4
	006/12	Chaplain Assistant	1	Enlisted-3
	006/13	Chaplain Assistant	2	Enlisted-3
Office of the Staff Judge Advocate	008A/01	Legal Administrator	1	Warrant Officer-2
	008A/02	Chief Legal NCO	1	Enlisted-7
	008B/01	Chief Administrative Law Attorney	1	Officer-4
	008B/02	Administrative Law Attorney	1	Officer-3
	008C/01	Chief Claims	1	Officer-3
	008D/01	Chief Legal Assistant	1	Officer-4
Directorate of Operations, Plans and Security	017C/01	Chief Operations and Scheduling	1	Officer-4
	017C/03	Operations NCO	1	Enlisted-8
	017C/04	Administrative Specialist	1	Enlisted-5
1st Battalion, 1st Infantry	025A/04	Legal Clerk	1	Enlisted-5
	025B/02B	Administrative Sergeant	1	Enlisted-5
Provost Marshall Office	028/02	Deputy Provost Marshall/Plans Officer	1	Officer-4
	028A/01	Operations Officer	1	Officer-3
	028A/04	Military Police Desk Sergeant	4	Enlisted-6
	028A/05	Military Police Desk Clerk	3	Enlisted-3
	028A/09	Traffic Section Leader	1	Enlisted-6
	028A/11	Traffic Accident Investigator	5	Enlisted-4
	028A/11A	Traffic Accident Investigator	1	Enlisted-3
	028A/14	Military Police Investigator	1	Enlisted-4
	028B/01	Administrative Sergeant	1	Enlisted-6
	028B/02	Military Police Clerk	2	Enlisted-3

Appendix F. Additional Billets Identified for Reclassification by the Audit

Location	Billet Number	Position Title	Number	Military Grade
Office of the Adjutant General	030C/01	NCO In Charge/Records	1	Enlisted-7
	030C/02	Personnel Records Specialist	2	Enlisted-5
	030D/02	Personnel Actions Sergeant	1	Enlisted-6
	030D/03	Personnel Management Specialist	1	Enlisted-5
	030D/04	Personnel Action Specialist	1	Enlisted-5
Directorate of Community and Family Activities	049B/02	Behavioral Science Specialist	1	Enlisted-6
DOIM	055A/01	Chief Plans and Programs	1	Officer-3
	056/01	Director Computer Systems Division	1	Officer-5
	056A/01	Chief Communications and Network	1	Officer-3
	056C/01	Chief System Software Support	1	Officer-3
	056D/01	Chief Software Engineer Branch	1	Officer-4
	057/01	Director Audio Visual Division	1	Officer-5
	057A/01	Chief Audio Visual Operation Maintenance	1	Officer-4
	057I/01	Chief Television Film Production Branch	1	Officer-4
Office of the Director of Intercollegiate Athletics	059A/02	Administrative Services Clerk	1	Enlisted-4
	059E/02C	Unit Supply Specialist	1	Enlisted-5
Office of the Commandant of Cadets	077/09	Administrative Supervisor For Honors	1	Enlisted-7
	082/01	Information Management Officer	1	Officer-4
Director of Admissions	091B/01	Executive Officer	1	Officer-3
	091C/01	Chief Records and Testing	1	Officer-4

Appendix G. Potential Monetary Benefits During the Execution of the Future Years Defense Program

Military Grade	Military Compensation (Base Year)[1]	Positions to be Eliminated	Benefit of Elimination (Base Year)[1]	Benefit of Elimination (6 Years)[2]
Officer-5	$99,258	7	$ 694,806	$4,168,836
Officer-4	$84,145	5	420,725	2,524,350
Officer-3	$69,295	4	277,180	1,663,080
Enlisted-7	$44,157	23	1,015,611	6,093,666
Enlisted-6	$37,096	2	74,192	445,152
Enlisted-4	$26,461	2	52,922	317,532
Totals		43	$2,535,436	$15,212,616

[1] Our estimate of potential monetary benefits is based on FY 1992 Military Pay Rates for the Army, published by the Comptroller of the Department of Defense, to support FY 1994 and FY 1995 Defense Business Operations Fund budget formulation.
[2] FY 1994 through FY 1999 Future Years Defense Program

Appendix H. Potential Monetary Benefits of Conversions

Military Grade	Civilian Grade Equivalent[1]	Military Compensation (Base Year)[2]	Civilian Compensation (Base Year)[2 3]	Number to be Converted	Total Military Compensation	Total Civilian Compensation	Benefit of Conversion (1 Year)	Benefit of Conversion (6 Years)[4]
Officer-5	GS-15	$99,258	$95,361	2	$ 198,516	$ 190,722	$ 7,794	$ 46,764
Officer-4	GS-14	$84,145	$81,071	9	757,305	729,639	27,666	165,996
Officer-3	GS-13	$69,295	$68,604	7	485,065	480,228	4,837	29,022
Warrant Officer-2	GS-11	$54,871	$48,135	1	54,871	48,135	6,736	40,416
Enlisted-8	GS-08	$51,269	$36,019	1	51,269	36,019	15,250	91,500
Enlisted-7	GS-07	$44,157	$32,524	3	132,471	97,572	34,899	209,394
Enlisted-6	GS-06	$37,096	$29,269	8	296,768	234,152	62,616	375,696
Enlisted-5	GS-06	$32,714	$29,269	8	261,712	234,152	27,560	165,360
Enlisted-4	GS-05	$26,461	$26,258	8	211,688	210,064	1,624	9,744
Enlisted-3	GS-04	$22,516	$23,470	9	202,644	211,230	(8,586)	(51,516)
Totals				56	$2,652,309	$2,471,913	$180,396	$1,082,376

[1] Equivalent civilian grade plus one.

[2] Our estimate of potential monetary benefits is based on FY 1992 Military-Civilian Equivalent Pay Rates for the Army, published by the Comptroller of the Department of Defense, to support FY 1994 and FY 1995 Defense Business Operations Fund budget formulation. We did not use the exact civilian equivalent for each military pay grade. Instead, we used the next higher civilian pay grade to allow for the overtime or additional staffing that may be needed as a result of the conversion from military to civilian billets.

[3] Civilian compensation includes an 8-percent locality differential.

[4] FY 1994 through FY 1999 Future Years Defense Program.

Appendix I. Summary of Potential Benefits Resulting from Audit

Recommendation Reference	Description of Benefit	Type of Benefit
1. and 2.	Economy and Efficiency. The deletion and reclassification of billets enhances the operation of the Academy and allows for the reassignment of military personnel to more essential functions within the Army.	The deletion and reclassification of billets will save $2.7 million per year or $16.3 million during the execution of the FY 1994 through FY 1999 Future Years Defense Program. (Funds put to better use.)

Appendix J. Organizations Visited or Contacted

Office of the Secretary of Defense

Assistant Secretary of Defense (Force Management and Personnel), Washington, DC

Department of the Army

Office of the Director of the Army Staff; Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, DC
Office of the Deputy Chief of Staff for Personnel; Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, DC
United States Military Academy, West Point, NY

Department of the Navy

United States Naval Academy, Annapolis, MD

Department of the Air Force

United States Air Force Academy, Colorado Springs, CO

Appendix K. Report Distribution

Office of the Secretary of Defense

Assistant Secretary of Defense (Force Management and Personnel)
Assistant Secretary of Defense (Public Affairs)
Comptroller of the Department of Defense

Department of the Army

Secretary of the Army
Superintendent, United States Military Academy
Inspector General, Department of the Army
Auditor General, U.S. Army Audit Agency

Department of the Navy

Auditor General, Naval Audit Service

Department of the Air Force

Auditor General, U.S. Air Force Audit Agency

Defense Agencies

Director, Defense Contract Audit Agency
Director, Defense Logistics Studies Information Exchange
Inspector General, Defense Intelligence Agency
Inspector General, National Security Agency

Non-DoD Offices

Office of Management and Budget
U.S. General Accounting Office, National Security and International Affairs Division, Technical Information Center

Non-DoD Offices (Cont'd)

Chairman and Ranking Minority Member of each of the following Congressional Committees and Subcommittees:

Senate Committee on Appropriations
Senate Subcommittee on Defense, Committee on Appropriations
Senate Committee on Armed Services
Senate Select Committee on Intelligence
Senate Committee on Governmental Affairs
Senate Subcommittee on Manpower and Personnel, Committee on Armed Services
House Committee on Appropriations
House Subcommittee on Defense, Committee on Appropriations
House Committee on Armed Services
House Subcommittee on Military Forces and Personnel, Committee on Armed Services
House Committee on Government Operations
House Subcommittee on Legislation and National Security, Committee on Government Operations
House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence
House Subcommittee on Oversight and Evaluation, Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence

Part IV - Management Comments

Department of the Army Comments

DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY
OFFICE OF THE DEPUTY CHIEF OF STAFF FOR PERSONNEL
WASHINGTON, DC 20310-0300

REPLY TO
ATTENTION OF

31 AUG 1993

MEMORANDUM THRU ~~DEPUTY CHIEF OF STAFF FOR PERSONNEL~~ F. E. VOLLRATH MG, GS, DMPM
~~THE CHIEF OF STAFF, ARMY~~ 1/9/93
~~ASSISTANT SECRETARY OF THE ARMY (MANPOWER AND RESERVE AFFAIRS)~~ (Signed) William D. Clark 9/7/93

FOR INSPECTOR GENERAL, DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE (AUDITING)

SUBJECT: Comments on the DoD Inspector General Report (DRAFT) on Noninstructional Military Positions at the United States Military Academy (Project No. 3RA-0001.02)

The purpose of this memorandum is to provide input to the DoD Inspector General Report (DRAFT) on Noninstructional Military Positions at the United States Military Academy. The audit was done in a professional manner and the efforts of the DoDIG team are appreciated.

The Superintendent, USMA, provided input to the Army Staff. This input has been reviewed and we concur with the Superintendent's comments (Enclosure 1).

F. E. VOLLRATH
Major General, GS
Director of Military
Personnel Management

Enclosure

CF:
SAIG-PA

OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDENT
UNITED STATES MILITARY ACADEMY
WEST POINT, NEW YORK 10996 5000

MAOR

30 AUG 1993

MEMORANDUM FOR Headquarters, Department of the Army, ATTN: DAPE-MPO (LTC McCowan), Washington, DC 20310

SUBJECT: Comments on the DOD Inspector General Report (DRAFT) on Noninstructional Military Positions at the United States Military Academy (Project No. 3RA-0001.02)

1. We have reviewed the DODIG report on noninstructional military positions at USMA. Our specific comments are provided at the enclosures. In general, we appreciate the audit team's professional insights concerning our personnel authorizations. However, careful consideration of the Report's language and findings reveals several areas where our different perspectives are important and merit comment.

2. It is important for us to remember that USMA operates on West Point which is a military reservation. As such, we accept responsibilities which transcend accomplishment of the specific mission of the Military Academy.

a. In evaluating force structure authorizations we follow DA guidance and operate in accordance with applicable regulations and operating procedures. As such, we do not *"overstate authorizations."*

b. In determining the appropriate classification of any position (e.g., grade level, civilian or military), we follow DOD and DA standard guidelines. Support for our military authorizations reflects DA priorities for assignment of military personnel.

3. In determining whether specific positions should be staffed by civilian or military personnel, we consider many factors. These include assessment of the duties and responsibilities of the position, any requirement for special skills or experience, the hours and other issues which may affect civilian employment, and professional development within the career field. In addition, we must recognize that the presence of soldiers, noncommissioned officers, and officers at USMA and on West Point is essential to the conduct of our mission. For example: Military Police provide an essential, positive image for visitors; their presence increases cadet exposure to

MAOR
SUBJECT: Comments on the DOD Inspector General Report (DRAFT) on Noninstructional Military Positions at the United States Military Academy (Project No. 3RA-0001.02)

soldiers; and, they improve the quality of life for our staff and faculty and their families. This contribution is not recognized by a narrow consideration of the *"law enforcement function"* which might be performed by a civilian security force.

4. In this light, we strongly support retention of the Tactical NCOs within our Brigade Tactical Department. In their review, the audit team characterized the company TAC NCO as *"not essential"* on the basis of *"workload"* and separation of function from the *" . . . tactical officers they assisted."* Unfortunately, this perspective ignores the critical role which the Tactical NCO fulfills in the development of cadets as future commissioned officers.

a. TAC NCOs are not assistant TAC Officers. The role of the NCO is separate from that of the officer. The TAC NCO provides an essential developmental relationship between the cadet and the noncommissioned officer - NCOs are the primary leaders of our individual soldiers and small tactical units.

b. Noncommissioned officers are directly involved with the development of prospective officers in all sources of commission (OCS, ROTC, and USMA). Our current ratio of TAC NCOs to cadets (1:120) is already at the minimal staffing level, and compares with a ratio of 1:41 to ROTC cadets. Studies of the performance of our graduates as officers reveal the need for greater exposure to NCOs during the four year West Point experience.

c. Finally, regarding the Tactical NCOs, the principal focus of this audit was on noninstructional military staff at USMA. As a consequence, the TAC NCO positions should not have been a part of the review - TAC NCOs are instructors in the Military Program. Our Military Program is a formal part of the four year developmental process. It is similar to the Academic and Physical Programs in that cadets receive formal instruction in military subjects (or courses), their performance is evaluated, they are required to achieve prescribed standards, and are amenable to remediation or separation for failure to perform in a satisfactory manner.

5. With respect to conversion of military to civilian spaces, the review team has suggested that a cost savings will accrue. In fact, conversion may not save money and

2

MAOR
SUBJECT: Comments on the DOD Inspector General Report (DRAFT) on Noninstructional Military Positions at the United States Military Academy (Project No. 3RA-0001.02)

certainly will cost more initially. In order to fund the conversion, USMA will require additional OMA obligational authority. Theoretically, the Army accrues "monetary benefit" in the MPA account. In practice, the Army will expend more OMA dollars at USMA to effect the recommended conversions. Furthermore, it can be argued that deletion of spaces will save money. However, the audit team did not demonstrate that the deletions they recommend would be cost-effective. Instead, they assert: *"the deletion and reclassification of billets enhances the operation of the Academy."* We disagree. The deletion of spaces will create greater challenges with respect to mission accomplishment.

6. Finally, we have already begun the process of reducing structure and costs of operation. We will continue this effort. In addition, we are ready to act on the DODIG recommendations with which we concur, as noted at the enclosure. Thank you for the opportunity to provide our views on this important topic.

HOWARD D. GRAVES
LTG, US Army
Superintendent

2 Encls
1. Concurrences
2. Nonconcurrences

3

CONCURRENCES

1. Concur with deletion/reclassification of the following positions (as listed in Appendix E and F).

DELETE

Department	TDA	Position Title	Number	Grade
Public Affairs Office	021A/04	Reporter	1	E-6
Office of the Commandant	078A/02A	Admin Specialist	1	E-6

RECLASSIFY

Department	TDA	Position Title	Number	Grade
Office of the Chaplain	006/10	Chaplain Ass't	1	E-5
	06/11	Chaplain Ass't	1	E-4
	006/12	Chaplain Ass't	1	E-3
	006/13	Chaplain Ass't	2	E-3
Directorate of Operations, Plans and Security	017C/04	Admin Specialist	1	E-5
1st Battalion 1st Infantry	025A/04	Legal Clerk	1	E-5
Office of the Adjutant General	030C/01	NCO in Charge/ Records	1	E-7
	030C/02	Personnel Records Specialist	2	E-5
	030D/02	Personnel Actions Sergeant	1	E-6
	030D/03	Personnel Mgmt Specialist	1	E-5
	030D/04	Personnel Actions Specialist	1	E-5
Directorate of Community and Family Activities	049B/02	Behavioral Science Specialist	1	E-6

Provost Marshal Office	028B/01	Administrative Sergeant	1	E-6
	028B/02	Military Police Clerk	2	E-3
Office of the Directorate of Intercollegiate Activities	059A/02	Administrative Services Clerk	1	E-4
	059E/02C	Unit Supply Specialist	1	E-5
Office of the Commandant	077/09	Administrative Supervisor for Honors	1	E-7

2a. We concur with removing, from the USMA TDA, the positions assigned to the Centers of Excellence (COE). However, we strongly believe it is essential to retain the COEs at West Point. The benefits derived from the COE's include:

(1) Allows USMA to bring officers with scientific specialties to teach cadets and conduct research.

(2) Provides USMA faculty members a better opportunity to conduct research.

(3) Enables cadets to conduct research under the supervision of a COE.

(4) Contributes to Middle States Association accreditation and the American Board of Education and Technology certification process.

(5) Enhances recruiting of civilian faculty by offering an opportunity for them to conduct research and continue scholarship while teaching cadets.

2b. We are continuing our efforts to find an alternative which will allow the COEs to remain here, but not incorporated on the Academy TDA. This will result in a cost savings against the USMA account. The following positions are included:

Department	TDA	Position Title	Number	Grade
Office of the Dean	060E/02	Director Office of Artificial Intel.	1	O-5
	060E/03	Research Scientist	1	O-4
	060E/04	Research Scientist	1	O-3
	060E/06	Computer Specialist	1	E-7
	060G/01	Permanent Associate	3	O-5

	Professor		
060G/02	Research Analyst	3	O-4
060H/01	Director of Operations Research Center	1	O-5
060H/02	Operations Research Analyst	3	O-3
072A/01	Director Office of Economic and Manpower Analysis	1	O-5
072A/02	Deputy Director of Economic and Manpower Analysis	1	O-5
072A/03	Research Analyst	1	O-4
072A/04	Programmer Analyst	1	E-7
072A/05	Programmer Analyst	1	E-7
072A/06	Programmer Analyst	1	E-4

3. 1st Battalion, 1st Infantry, 025B/02B, Administrative Sergeant, 1, E-5, was removed from the TDA prior to the DODIG audit.

NONCONCURRENCES

1. Office of the Commandant of Cadets, 083-086, Tactical Noncommissioned Officers (NCO), 20, E-7. Tactical NCOs have a critical instructional mission with the Corps of Cadets. These NCOs teach cadets how officers and NCOs interact and work together. They also teach cadets the duties and responsibilities of the NCO Corps. They teach leadership development classes, and formally counsel cadets holding NCO leadership positions. Studies have found that academy graduates are relatively weak in their ability to work effectively with NCOs. As a result, the Superintendent decided, in September 1992, to transfer NCOs from other USMA agencies to the Corps of Cadets. Additionally, our current authorizations provide an NCO/cadet ratio of 1/120, while the typical ROTC detachment has a 1/41 ratio. It is difficult to imagine the U.S. military's premier leadership school attempting to accomplish its mission without the valuable instruction of the Tactical NCOs. Nonetheless, we are committed to ensuring that all our initiatives are cost-effective. We will assess the value of the Tactical NCO program in 1997. By that time, sufficient feedback from the Army will assure that we have an accurate assessment of the worth of the program. Adjustments, as necessary, will be made at that time.

2. Office of the Staff Judge Advocate (SJA), TDA positions: 008A/01, 008A/02, 008B/01, 008B/02, 008C/01, 008D/01. This organization is currently operating with 26 authorizations, well below the documented workload requirements of 33 personnel. This results in weeknight and weekend overtime requirements. As the Army continues to downsize, the regional area mission requirements for this office increase proportionally, requiring further overtime. Furthermore, administering the Uniform Code of Military Justice and the military legal system requires special military knowledge, skills, and training. The military legal system is not taught in any civilian school. Advising commanders on legal matters, prosecuting courts-martial, and providing expertise in military administrative adjudicatory proceedings clearly mandate maintaining uniformed personnel. Finally, any proposed changes to the staffing of SJA offices, must be coordinated with the Office of The Judge Advocate General. We are willing to initiate action to downgrade the Chief Legal NCO, 008A/02, from E-7 to E-6.

3. Directorate of Operations, Plans and Security (DOPS), positions 017C/01, 017C/03. These positions are clearly military unique functions which require experience and expertise in planning and executing military type operations. In addition to serving the Corps of Cadets, DOPS has Major Command (MACOM) responsibilities which make having expertise in military operations even more critical.

Additionally, these positions require extensive overtime which would make conversion costs prohibitive.

4. Provost Marshal Office (PMO), all positions listed at Appendix F, Draft DODIG Report, except 028B/01, Administrative Sergeant, 1, E-6, and 028B/02, Military Police Clerk, 2, E-3. This organization has undergone significant personnel cuts and conversions already. Additional changes to the structure will result in serious denigration of mission accomplishment. Our law enforcement mission is accomplished by soldiers assigned to a military organization. While performing their law enforcement mission, it is critical these young soldiers receive guidance, supervision, and training from military leaders. In addition to the law enforcement mission, there are other functions, such as funeral support, which they provide to support the enlisted, officer, and retired population both on West Point proper and regionally. Personnel assigned to the PMO work long hours. Many are on a rotating shift work schedule and many others are on call 24 hours a day. Converting to civilian positions will significantly increase the operational costs of the PMO. Additionally, to perform their duties, these personnel must be thoroughly trained in the Uniformed Code of Military Justice, military unique aspects of administering law and order, and the military disciplinary system - administrative as well as judicial.

5. Director of Admissions, 091B/01, Executive Officer, O-3. This is the only military position in the Administrative Branch. A major function of this position is to provide the primary military presence for the daily and overnight tour program for cadet candidates (over 1,000 annually) and their parents. This officer's ability to represent the Army and USMA, answering questions based on personal experience, in addition to stating official policy, is vital to the success of the tour program.

6. Office of the Superintendent, 001/07, Chauffeur, 1, E-6. This position is essential to the mission of USMA. The chauffeur ensures that the Superintendent, to include visiting dignitaries, arrive for meetings, briefings and ceremonies on time. In addition to performing driving duties, the chauffeur is also responsible for the following: military and civilian travel coordination, routine office administration, and prioritizing and routing taskings to the Superintendent's staff. It is not feasible to use the other enlisted aides as chauffeur as they are specially trained stewards whose duty includes supporting all official functions held at the Superintendent's quarters. They cannot be stewards and drivers at the same time. Although we are opposed to eliminating this position, we are willing to consider other alternatives.

7. Information management at USMA is a highly complex, vital function which requires a balanced mix of highly trained uniformed and civilian personnel. Recent restructuring has resulted in streamlining, as well as downsizing our information management functions and organization. Despite past efforts, we know we need to do even more, and we will do so. However, to eliminate, civilianize and/or consolidate is not the answer. The DOIM is not staffed or organized to replace agency Information Management Officers, absorb their duties, and/or supervise them. In order to support the academic and leader development information management needs of the Corps of Cadets, we must have a rotating base of personnel who can receive the best and most current education possible. It simply is not feasible to remove all uniformed personnel from information management positions at USMA. These positions also provide critical professional development for future Army needs. We will conduct a complete review of our information management needs and organizational structure with emphasis on the following positions.

Department	TDA	Position Title	Number	Grade
Office of Commandant	082/01	Information Mgmt Officer	1	O-4
DOIM	055A/01	Chief Plans and Programs	1	O-3
	056/01	Director Computer Systems Div	1	O-5
	056A/01	Chief Communications and Network	1	O-3
	056C/01	Chief System Software Support	1	O-3
	056D/01	Chief Software Engineer Branch	1	O-4
	057/01	Director Audio Visual Division	1	O-5
	057A/01	Chief Audio Visual Operation Maintenance	1	O-4
	057I/01	Chief Television Film Production Branch	1	O-4
Director of Admissions	091C/01	Chief Records and Testing	1	O-4

8. Appendices C and D contain several errors and should be corrected as follows:

a. The following positions listed in Appendix D (Reclassification by Academy) need to be moved to Appendix C

(Deletion by Academy): 056D/06, Programmer Analyst, 3, E-3; 056E/02, Machine Console Operator, 2, E-7.

b. The following position should be added to Appendix C: 056E/03, Machine Console Operator, 2, E-6.

c. The following enlisted grade errors need to be corrected:

Appendix	Position Number	Reads	Should Read
C	057C/04	Enlisted-2	Enlisted-3
C	057F/02	Enlisted-5	Enlisted-6
D	056A/02A	Enlisted-7	Enlisted-6
D	056E/05	Enlisted-3	Enlisted-4
D	057C/01	Enlisted-6	Enlisted-7

Audit Team Members

William F. Thomas	Director, Readiness and Operational Support Directorate
Harlan M. Geyer	Program Director
Geraldine M. Edwards	Project Manager
Mary E. Smith	Team Leader
James N. Baker	Auditor
Rigoberto Luis	Auditor
Shibani B. Barot	Auditor
Nancy C. Cipolla	Editor
JoAnn B. Fowler	Administrative Support