Audit Report

OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL

REPORT ON THE AUDIT OF THE U.S. AIR FORCE PREPARATORY SCHOOL

Report No. 95-077 January 18, 1995

Department of Defense

Additional Copies

To obtain additional copies of this report, contact the Secondary Reports Distribution Unit, Audit Planning and Technical Support Directorate, at (703) 604-8937 (DSN 664-8937) or FAX (703) 604-8932.

Suggestions for Future Audits

To suggest ideas for or to request future audits, contact the Planning and Coordination Branch, Audit Planning and Technical Support Directorate, at (703) 604-8939 (DSN 664-8939) or FAX (703) 604-8932. Ideas and requests can also be mailed to:

Inspector General, Department of Defense
OAIG-AUD (ATTN: APTS Audit Suggestions)
400 Army Navy Drive (Room 801)
Arlington, Virginia 22202-2884

DoD Hotline

To report fraud, waste, or abuse, call the DoD Hotline at (800) 424-9098 or write to the DoD Hotline, The Pentagon, Washington, D.C. 20301-1900. The identity of writers and callers is fully protected.

Acronyms

GAO	General Accounting Office
OSD	Office of the Secretary of Defense

INSPECTOR GENERAL
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE
400 ARMY NAVY DRIVE
ARLINGTON, VIRGINIA 22202-2884

January 18, 1995

MEMORANDUM FOR ASSISTANT SECRETARY OF THE AIR FORCE
(FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT AND COMPTROLLER)

SUBJECT: Report on the Audit of the U.S. Air Force Preparatory School
(Report No. 95-077)

This final report is provided for your information and use. It discusses the requirements to use military personnel at the U.S. Air Force Preparatory School. We issued this report to expeditiously resolve the military personnel requirement before staffing assignments for the Preparatory School. Management comments on a draft of the report were considered in preparing the final report.

As a result of management comments, we revised specific positions and grade authorizations and associated monetary benefits. Nevertheless, the comments conformed to the requirements of DoD Directive 7650.3, and there are no unresolved issues. Therefore, no additional comments are required.

The courtesies extended to the audit staff are appreciated. If you have questions on this audit, please contact Mr. Harlan M. Geyer, Audit Program Director, at (703) 604-9594 (DSN 664-9594) or Mr. Richard A. Brown, Audit Project Manager, at (703) 604-9483 (DSN 664-9483). The distribution of this report is listed in Appendix J. The audit team members are listed inside the back cover.

Robert J. Lieberman
Assistant Inspector General
for Auditing

Office of the Inspector General, DoD

Report No. 95-077 **January 18, 1995**
(Project No. 4RA-5051)

THE U.S. AIR FORCE PREPARATORY SCHOOL

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction. A declining Defense budget and the overall downsizing of the U.S. military force structure have prompted Congress to mandate that the Air Force Academy reduce the Cadet Wing from 4,500 to 4,000 by 1995. The Senate Committee on Armed Services requested an audit to help identify ways to reduce overhead and operating costs of the Military Department academies.

Objectives. Our objectives were to determine whether the operations of the Military Department academies are within the intent and scope of the United States Code, title 10, sections 8011 to 9355, and DoD guidance and to evaluate the economy and efficiency of the operations of the academies. This report is one in a series on academy operations.

Audit Results. The U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School assigned nine military personnel to staff positions, although mission requirements did not support the need for military-unique skills. Use of civilians in those positions would not only be more cost-effective, but would also provide greater continuity and stability to the Preparatory School's programs and operations (see Part II for details).

Internal Controls. The audit did not assess internal controls related to the audit objective because of the need to provide a timely response before assignment of new military personnel. An assessment of internal controls will be performed as part of the continuing audit involving the entire operations of the U.S. Air Force Academy.

Potential Benefits of Audit. Implementation of the recommendations will provide management with the ability to reassign military personnel within the Air Force without affecting the mission of the Air Force Academy Preparatory School or the maintenance of the quality of life. Implementation will also provide potential monetary benefits of $.9 million during the execution of the FY 1995 through FY 2000 Future Years Defense Program (see Appendixes G and H).

Summary of Recommendations. We recommend that the Superintendent, U.S. Air Force Academy, initiate actions to convert nine military positions to civilian positions on the staffing document of the Academy, realign the duties and responsibilities of three other positions, obtain increased civilian end-strength and payroll authorizations, and reevaluate the requirement for other personnel.

Management Comments. The Air Force partially concurred that nine military positions could be converted to civilian, but did not concur with the specific positions and grade authorizations and provided alternatives. Details on management comments and audit responses are in Part II of the report, and the full text of management comments is in Part IV.

Audit Response. Based on the information provided by the Air Force, we revised the specific positions and grade authorizations and made minor adjustments to estimates of monetary benefits. Nonetheless, Air Force comments meet the intent of the recommendations, and no further comments are required.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary i

Part I - Introduction 1

Background 2
Objectives 2
Scope and Methodology 3
Internal Controls 3
Prior Audits and Other Reviews 3

Part II - Finding and Recommendations 5

Adjustments to Military Personnel Assigned to the Preparatory School 6

Part III - Additional Information 17

Appendix A. U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School Instructional Positions 18
Appendix B. U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School Noninstructional Positions 19
Appendix C. Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews 20
Appendix D. Positions Identified for Conversion 23
Appendix E. Positions Identified for Future Consideration 24
Appendix F. Positions Identified for Other Actions 25
Appendix G. Potential Monetary Benefits of Conversions 26
Appendix H. Summary of Potential Benefits Resulting from Audit 27
Appendix I. Organizations Visited or Contacted 28
Appendix J. Report Distribution 29

Part IV - Management Comments 31

Department of the Air Force Comments 32

Part I - Introduction

Background

The U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School (Prep School), a subordinate organization to the U.S. Air Force Academy, was established in 1961 in Colorado Springs, Colorado. Air Force Instruction 36-2021, "Air Force Academy Preparatory School," July 19, 1994, states that the Prep School mission is to prepare, motivate, and evaluate selected personnel who meet the special needs of the Air Force both for admission to and success at the Air Force Academy. The U.S. Air Force Academy has further defined the mission of the Prep School in Draft Air Force Academy Mission Directive 28, "United States Air Force Academy Prep School," November 1994. The draft Directive states that the basic educational responsibility of the Prep School is:

> to provide in-depth, basic instruction, in mathematics, English, and science to increase the students' capabilities to the point where they can qualify to enter the Cadet Wing and have an improved probability of graduating from the United States Air Force Academy.

To accomplish that mission, cadet candidates attend the Prep School for the academic year beginning in August and ending in May. The Prep School is a postsecondary school, providing 10 months of preparation for entrance into the Air Force Academy and is not an accredited institution. The Prep School accomplishes its mission through in-depth instruction in English, mathematics, and sciences; athletic development; military training; and character development. Additionally, the Prep School staff provides role models and career counseling to cadet candidates.

The Prep School is authorized 38 positions: 34 military positions and 4 civilian positions. The military authorization for each functional element is identified on the U.S. Air Force Academy Prep School July 1994 Extended Unit Manpower Document. The Prep School's FY 1994 expenditures totaled $116,200, and the FY 1995 budget is $110,000, excluding military pay and benefits.

Objectives

The Senate Committee on Armed Services requested the audit. The objectives of the audit were to determine whether the operations of the Military Department academies are within the intent and scope of the United States Code, title 10, sections 8011 to 9355, and DoD guidance and to evaluate the economy and efficiency of the operations of the Military Department academies. This report is one in a series of reports on academy operations.

Scope and Methodology

We evaluated which instructional and noninstructional military staff positions at the Prep School were essential. We also evaluated whether the essential positions could be filled by civilians, without affecting the accomplishment of the mission of the Prep School. The audit did not involve the use of statistical projections because all military positions at the Prep School were reviewed. Also, we did not rely on computer-processed data in forming audit conclusions.

We reviewed and analyzed instructions and job descriptions related to the 34 authorized military positions at the Prep School (Appendixes A and B). We also reviewed Prep School staffing studies; the Superintendent's Spring Evaluation Reports for 1993 and 1994; and the Director, Accession Policy, Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense (Force Management Policy), report on the Service Academy Prep Schools Project. We evaluated the 34 authorized military positions at the Prep School and interviewed the personnel who either occupied those positions or supervised the personnel in the positions. The audit was made in October 1994 at the organizations listed in Appendix I.

This economy and efficiency audit was made in accordance with auditing standards issued by the Comptroller General of the United States as implemented by the Inspector General, DoD.

Internal Controls

The audit did not assess internal controls as they related to the audit objectives because of the need to provide a timely response before assignment of new military personnel to the Prep School. An assessment of internal controls will be performed as part of the continuing audit involving the entire operations of the U.S. Air Force Academy.

Prior Audits and Other Reviews

Within the last 5 years, the General Accounting Office (GAO) issued three reports that discuss the military academies' operations. The Director, Accession Policy, Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense (Force Management Policy), also contracted with the American Council on Education's Center for Adult Learning and Educational Credentials for a report assessing the three Military Department academies' Prep Schools. The Commander of the Prep School had an internal staffing study performed to determine whether a few civilian instructors, with more subject area expertise, would help reduce the work load at the Prep School. Appendix C summarizes prior audits and other reviews.

Part II - Finding and Recommendations

Adjustments to Military Personnel Assigned to the Preparatory School

The Prep School had designated nine positions as military unique, although the duties and responsibilities of those positions could be accomplished more cost-effectively by using civilians. If the Air Force civilianized those positions, nine military personnel could be available for reassignment to more essential functions within the Air Force, and the use of civilians would provide greater continuity and stability to the Prep School's programs and operations. Additionally, there would be a net monetary benefit of $.9 million in the Future Years Defense Program.

Instructional Military Staff Uses and Structure

The Prep School places heavy emphasis on the academic program. The academic curriculum focuses on three specific subjects: English, mathematics and science. Courses are geared to and taught at the junior college level. Additionally, instruction is provided in effective study skills. The goals of the academic area are to provide a solid foundation of skills in each subject area and to increase the cadet candidates' verbal and math scores on the Scholastic Aptitude Test and math and English scores on the American College of Testing for entrance into the U.S. Air Force Academy.

Academic Division at the Prep School. The Academic Division is authorized 20 military instructional positions (Appendix A). We interviewed the 20 military personnel filling those positions. The positions in the Academic Division include department heads, executive officers, instructors, and course directors. Each instructor is also an academic advisor of approximately 10 cadet candidates. Because, the Prep School is not an accredited institution, the academic staff is not required to have either a teaching certificate or a master's degree in the subject area. As a result, most of the staff members have limited teaching experience, but do have a degree in a field related to the area they are teaching. Based on our interviews and our analyses of the duties and responsibilities of the positions, we agreed with the Commander of the Prep School that six positions (18424, 0872, 1467, 17667, 15332, and 15329) do not require military skills and could be converted to civilian positions (Appendix D). By converting the positions to civilian, the Prep School could gain faculty members with academic degrees in the subject areas they teach, teacher certifications, and documented teaching experience. The benefit for the cadet candidates would be more qualified instructors who can better evaluate academic deficiencies and identify corrective methods.

Academic Dean. The Academic Program Manager (Academic Dean), who is also the Vice Commander of the Prep School, is responsible for the academic program at the Prep School. The dean has oversight of the curriculum,

academic instruction, and learning skills development. The primary duties and responsibilities of the Academic Dean do not require military-unique skills or expertise, and the position could be held by a civilian without degrading the mission of the Academic Division. Additionally, the duties of the Vice Commander could be realigned under the military training division at the Prep School. We believe that the Academic Dean's position (19905, Appendix E) should be reevaluated to determine the validity of a military member occupying that position. The Commander of the Prep School agreed to reevaluate the Academic Dean's position after full implementation of the conversion of the military instructional positions to civilians.

English Department. The English courses at the Prep School focus primarily on writing, grammar, vocabulary, sentence structure, and essays. No technical writing is taught. The English Department is authorized five military positions. A Prep School official stated that the English Department is one of the hardest departments for hiring qualified enlisted military personnel. For example, for school year 1994 through 1995, the Prep School received no applications for an enlisted English instructor position. As a result, Prep School officials reverted to applications submitted for the prior school year to fill the position. Based on our interviews with Prep School officials and our analyses of the duties and responsibilities of the English Department, we determined that one military position (18424, Appendix D) could be converted to a civilian position and one other position (12822, Appendix F) should be downgraded. The Commander agreed with the actions.

Conversion of One Position From Military to Civilian. We interviewed the five military personnel occupying positions in the English Department. Through those interviews, we determined that one (Table 1.) of the five positions, although essential, does not require military-unique skills or expertise to effectively perform duties and functions. The conversion of the position to a civilian, possessing subject area credentials, could provide continuity in the English Department without reducing the effectiveness or efficiency of the English Program. For example, the Prep School could eliminate the difficulty in hiring enlisted military personnel in the English Department by converting a military instructor position to a civilian position. The Commander of the Prep School stated that a civilian possessing subject area credentials would be more beneficial to the English Department if placed as the head of the English Department. The head of the English Department is responsible for developing the cadet candidates' English skills. The head of the English Department also plans, organizes, and implements six junior college level courses on grammar, literature, essay composition, and research writing and directs the Prep School's reading program. We believe that the Prep School should realign the duties and responsibilities of the head of the English Department to the instructor position that should be converted to civilian. The Commander agreed to the conversion.

Table 1. English Department Position Identified for Conversion		
Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
18424	Instructor	Enlisted-7

Reclassification of Executive Officer Position. The Instructor (12805, Table 2.) functions as the executive officer for the English Department and assists in planning, coordinating, and supervising an English curriculum covering grammar, literature, essay composition, and research writing. The duties and responsibilities of an executive officer could be realigned under a position classified as a senior military technical advisor.

Table 2. English Department Position Identified for Other Action		
Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
12805	Instructor (Executive Officer)	Officer-3
12822	Academic Program Manager (Head, English Department)	Officer-4

We believe that position 12822 (Table 2.) should be reclassified from the head of the English Department to an instructor to include downgrading the requirement for an Officer-4 instructor to an Officer-3 instructor. The Commander agreed with realigning the duties and responsibilities of the head of the English Department to position 18424 and downgrading position 12822.

We believe that after the conversion of position 18424 and the realignment of duties and responsibilities in the English Department, the Prep School should reevaluate the requirement for military personnel to occupy the remaining military positions in the English Department since no special military skills are required to teach basic English elements. Because the Prep School had problems filling an English position for school year 1994 through 1995, we believe that the potential exists for converting at least one other position (18326, Appendix E) from military to civilian without hindering the English Department's ability to accomplish the assigned mission. The Commander of the Prep School agreed to reevaluate all positions in the English Department after full implementation of the conversion of position 18424 from military to civilian.

Mathematics Department. The mathematics courses provided at the Prep School are algebra, geometry, trigonometry, and calculus. The Mathematics

Department is authorized 10 military positions, 9 instructional positions and 1 noninstructional position.* Of the 10 positions, 3 instructional military positions (0872, 1467, and 17667, Appendix D) could be converted to civilian positions without hindering the mission of the Mathematics Department. We also determined that the duties and responsibilities of the executive officer for the Mathematics Department (position 01198, Appendix F) could be realigned as a senior military technical advisor without hindering the department's ability to accomplish its assigned mission. The Commander of the Prep School agreed to the conversion and realignment.

Conversion of Positions From Military to Civilian. Through interviews and analyses, we determined that the instructional positions listed in Table 3. were mission essential; however, they did not require military-unique skills. For example, the head of the Mathematics Department is responsible for the largest academic department at the Prep School. That person directs the development of the cadet candidates' math skills and plans, organizes, and implements junior college level courses on algebra, geometry, trigonometry, Newtonian physics and calculus. The Prep School does not teach mathematics as it applies to the military. By converting the head of the Mathematics Department and two instructors to civilian positions, the Mathematics Department would gain fully qualified and certified personnel who have teaching experience, and the conversion would provide continuity and stability within the program.

Table 3. Mathematics Department Positions Identified for Conversion

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
0872	Academic Program Manager (Head, Mathematics Department)	Officer-4
1467	Instructor	Officer-3
17667	Instructor	Enlisted-7

Reclassification of Executive Officer Position. The Mathematics Department Instructor (position 01198) functions as the executive officer of the Mathematics Department and directs, organizes, and develops junior college level courses in mathematics. The executive officer also provides training for new instructors in the Mathematics Department. After the position (0872) of the head of the Mathematics Department is converted from military to civilian,

* After our audit, the Prep School realigned the noninstructional position from the Mathematics Department to the Administration Division. The report discusses the position under Administration Division.

a valid requirement will no longer exist for an executive officer. Therefore, the duties and responsibilities of an executive officer (Table 4.) should be realigned as a senior military technical advisor.

Table 4. Mathematics Department Position Identified for Other Action

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
01198	Instructor (Executive Officer)	Officer-3

After the position of head of the Mathematics Department is converted from military to civilian, we believe the Prep School should reevaluate the requirement for military personnel to occupy the remaining military positions in the Mathematics Department (Appendix E). The curriculum of the Mathematics Department is directed to college entry level mathematics. Therefore, converting at least one other position from military to civilian would not hinder the department's ability to accomplish the assigned mission. The Commander of the Prep School agreed to reevaluate the positions in the Mathematics Department after the positions are converted from military to civilian.

Science Department. The Science Department provides introductory level instruction for cadet candidates in courses such as the basic concepts and principles of chemistry and physics. The Prep School also provides rudimentary training in computer science courses. The computer courses include basic computer skills, Microsoft Disk Operating System, Windows, Quattro-Pro and Turbo Pascal. The Science Department is authorized five military personnel to teach the science and computer courses. We interviewed the four assigned personnel. (The fifth position was vacant.) Of the four positions, two instructional military positions (15332 and 15329, Appendix D) could be converted to civilian positions without hindering the mission of the Science Department. We also determined that the duties and responsibilities of the executive officer for the Science Department (position 15330, Appendix F) could be realigned as a senior military technical advisor without hindering the Science Department's ability to accomplish its assigned mission. The Commander of the Prep School endorsed our conclusions.

Conversion of Positions From Military to Civilian. Through our interviews and a review of the duties of all Science Department positions, we determined that two positions (Table 5.), although mission-essential, did not require military-unique skills or expertise. Therefore, converting the positions from military to civilian would provide subject area expertise and teacher certification without degrading the effectiveness and efficiency of the Science Department. For example, the head of the Science Department is responsible for developing the scientific and learning skills of the cadet candidates and for planning, organizing, and implementing six courses in four subject areas. The head of the Science Department also supervises three assigned instructors and

nine adjunct instructors. No military-unique skills are required to effectively or efficiently carry out the duties and responsibilities of the head of the Science Department position. Therefore, a civilian could fill the position.

Table 5. Science Department Positions Identified for Conversion

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
15332	Academic Program Manager (Head, Science Department)	Officer-4
15329	Instructor	Officer-3

Reclassification of Executive Officer Position. The Science Department Instructor (position 15330) functions as the executive officer of the Science Department and directs, organizes, and develops junior college level courses in four subject areas. The executive officer also provides training for new instructors in the Science Department. After the position of the head of the Science Department is converted from military to civilian, a valid requirement will no longer exist for an executive officer. Therefore, the duties and functions of an executive officer (Table 6.) should be realigned as a senior military technical advisor.

Table 6. Science Department Position Identified for Other Action

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
15330	Instructor (Executive Officer)	Officer-3

Noninstructional Military Staff Uses and Structure

The Prep School overstated the 14 noninstructional military requirements (Appendix B) in the functional elements of administration, athletics, and counseling. Three military positions (17644, 12826, and 12843, Appendix D) could be converted to civilian positions without degrading the missions of the affected organizations. Our conclusions are based on the considerations discussed below.

Administration Division. The Administration Division is authorized four noninstructional military positions (including the one transferred from the

Mathematics Department.) We discussed the duties and responsibilities of the positions with all four military personnel. Based on our discussions and analysis of the documentation relating to the duties and responsibilities of the positions, we determined that one military position, communication computer systems programmer craftsman, could be converted to a civilian position without any adverse effect. The Commander of the Prep School agreed to the conversion.

Although the position of communication computer systems programmer craftsman (Table 7.) is mission essential, it does not require military skills or knowledge. The communication computer systems programmer craftsman within the Administration Division is responsible for managing all computer-related activities at the Prep School, to include maintenance of computer hardware and software, computer security, and acquisition of computers. None of the responsibilities of the position require military-related expertise; therefore, a civilian could fill the position.

Table 7. Administration Office Position Identified for Conversion

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
17644	Communication Computer System Programmer Craftsman (Chief, Computer Information Services)	Enlisted-7

Athletics Department. The Athletics Department at the Prep School provides organization scheduling and supervision for all athletic programs (varsity, intramurals, and physical conditioning). The Athletics Department emphasizes physical fitness of the cadet candidates, and its primary goal is to prepare the cadet candidates for the candidate fitness test. The Prep School also offers several varsity sports, such as football and men's and women's basketball, as well as intramural programs. The Athletics Department is authorized 4 military positions; however, 11 military personnel are assigned, of which 4 are permanent and 7 are temporary. The seven temporary personnel are second lieutenants with assignments ranging from a few months to the full school year. Based on our discussions and analysis of the documentation relating to the duties and responsibilities of the positions, we determined that one military position, physical therapy craftsman, could be converted to a civilian position without any adverse effect.

Although we believe the position of physical therapy craftsman (Table 8.) is essential, we determined that military-unique skills were not required to perform the duties. The physical therapy provided to the cadet candidates at the Prep School would be a more effective and efficient operation if the military position, physical therapy craftsman, was converted to a civilian position, sports medicine

technician. A certified sports medicine technician would be more thoroughly trained in sports injuries and treatment. The Commander of the Prep School endorsed the proposed conversion.

Table 8. Athletics Department Position Identified for Conversion

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
12826	Physical Therapy Craftsman (Athletics Trainer)	Enlisted-6

Prep School Counselor. The Academic Program Manager (Prep School Counselor) oversees the counseling program that helps cadet candidates overcome personal and behavioral problems and academic deficiencies. Although the Prep School has only one authorized military counselor, it also provides academic advisors and military training advisors for the cadet candidates. The counselor position is designed to be independent of the other functional areas (that is, academic program, athletic program, and military training program), thus providing the cadet candidates an objective view and analysis of the situation at hand. In addition to the authorized military counselor, other alternative sources for counseling are available to the cadet candidates, such as the academy chaplain, the Cadet Counseling Center, social actions, the Family Support Center, and the mental health section at the hospital.

Through our interview with the Prep School counselor and our analysis of the duties of the position, we determined that the position is essential to the Prep School's mission, but it does not necessitate military-unique skills or expertise. Converting the Academic Program Manager position (Table 9.) to a civilian, who has credentials and experience in counseling students of the same age as cadet candidates, could provide the Prep School continuity and stability without degrading the counseling program. The conversion could also provide the Prep School with research on the trends of the cadet candidates' academic and behavioral patterns from year to year. Such research and analysis could allow the Prep School to better address the needs of future cadet candidates. The Commander of the Prep School agreed to the conversion.

Table 9. Counselor Position Identified for Conversion

Position Number	Position Title	Military Grade
12843	Academic Program Manager (Director of Counseling and Study Development)	Officer-3

Military Training Division. The Military Training Division is responsible for providing instruction and administering the military training program for:

- o military discipline,
- o drill,
- o command and control,
- o conduct,
- o honor,
- o appearance,
- o housekeeping,
- o leadership,
- o motivation, and
- o customs and courtesies of the Air Force.

Additionally, the Military Training Division supports the Athletics Department in administering the physical conditioning and intramurals programs. The Military Training Division, which is authorized four military positions, conducts basic military training in the beginning of the school year and the teamwork exercise at the end of the school year. Through interviews with staff members in the division and our analyses of the duties and functions of the four positions, we determined that the positions are mission essential, and require military skills and expertise. Therefore, we are recommending no adjustments to the positions.

Summary

The purpose of the Prep School is to prepare cadet candidates for entrance into and success at the Air Force Academy. The Prep School accomplishes those tasks through junior college level academic classes, physical training, military training, and character development. The Prep School has overstated the need for military personnel required to prepare and evaluate cadet candidates for entrance into the Air Force Academy. Of the 34 authorized military positions at the Prep School, 9 are mission essential, but the duties do not require military-unique skills and could be converted to civilian positions. Conversion of the nine positions from military to civilian would provide continuity and stability in the execution of the Prep School mission and would allow the presently assigned military personnel to be reassigned to more essential functions within the operational elements of the Air Force. In addition, civilianizing the positions would provide net savings of $.9 million in the Future Years Defense Program (Appendixes G and H).

Recommendations, Management Comments, and Audit Response

We recommend that the Superintendent, U.S. Air Force Academy:

1. Reclassify the nine military positions listed in Appendix D as civilian positions on the U.S. Air Force Academy's Unit Manpower Document.

Air Force Comments. The Air Force partially concurred with reclassifying the positions identified in the report. For the English Department, the Air Force identified an Enlisted-7 position, instead of an Officer-4 position, to be converted to a civilian position to eliminate the difficulty in hiring enlisted English instructors. In addition, the Air Force identified an Officer-4 position to be downgraded to an Officer-3 position.

For the Mathematics Department, the Air Force identified an Enlisted-7 position instead of an Officer-3 position to be converted to a civilian position. The Air Force identified an Enlisted-7 position because only two of the last five enlisted mathematics instructors possessed the qualifications and abilities to teach the entire math curriculum.

Audit Response. Based on the information provided in the Air Force comments, we revised the final report and associated monetary benefits. The Air Force response meets the intent of the recommendation.

2. Realign the duties and responsibilities of the three positions listed in Appendix F on the U.S. Air Force Academy's Unit Manpower Document.

Air Force Comments. The Air Force concurred with the recommendation.

3. Obtain increased civilian end-strength authorizations and civilian payroll authority to reclassify the nine military positions in Recommendation 1 to civilian positions.

Air Force Comments. The Air Force concurred with the recommendation.

4. Reevaluate the requirement for military personnel as the academic dean in the English Department and in the Mathematics Department after full implementation of Recommendation 1.

Air Force Comments. The Air Force stated that it was in the process of converting 25 percent of the Academy's faculty positions to civilian positions, and planned a review in 2000 to see whether additional conversions may be appropriate.

Audit Response. The Air Force response meets the intent of the recommendation.

Part III - Additional Information

Appendix A. U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School Instructional Positions

Department	Authorized	Assigned	Audited
Dean of Academics	1	2	2
English Department	5	5	5
Mathematics Department	9	9	9
Science Department	5	4	4
Total	20	20	20

Appendix B. U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School Noninstructional Positions

Department	Authorized	Assigned	Audited
Commander	2	3	1
Office of Administration	4	4	4
Athletics Department	4	11	4
Military Training Division	4	4	4
Total	14	22	13

Appendix C. Summary of Prior Audits and Other Reviews

General Accounting Office (GAO) Reports

GAO Report No. GAO/NSIAD-92-57. In October 1991, the House Committee on Armed Services asked GAO to conduct a review of the Military Department academy preparatory schools. GAO issued Report No. GAO/NSIAD-92-57 (Office of the Secretary of Defense [OSD] Case No. 8928), "DoD Service Academies: Academy Preparatory Schools Need a Clearer Mission and Better Oversight," March 13, 1992. The report states that the Department of Defense has limited information on the quality of the schools' programs and the program reviews of the preparatory schools conducted by the academy faculty do not assess the schools against a uniform set of quality and performance standards. The report recommends that the Secretary of Defense determine what role the preparatory schools should play among the Military Departments' officer production programs and direct the Military Departments to clarify the missions of their schools. In addition, the report recommends the establishment of appropriate standards applicable to the schools' faculties and curriculums and periodic independent reviews to ensure that the schools meet those standards. OSD concurred with the principal findings and recommendations and stated that it had initiated actions to improve cost reporting and efficiencies, management, and supervision of those programs.

GAO Report No. GAO/T-NSIAD-90-28. In October 1989, the Senate Committee on Armed Services asked the GAO to perform an audit of the military academies. GAO issued two reports, indicating that efficiencies could be attained in the operations at the academies: Report No. GAO/T-NSIAD-90-28 (OSD Case No. 8294), "Review of the Cost and Operations of DoD's Service Academies," April 4, 1990, and Report No. GAO/NSIAD-91-79 (OSD Case No. 8585), "DoD Service Academies: Improved Cost and Performance Monitoring Needed," July 16, 1991. The reports discuss audit oversight of the academies. The reports state that more oversight was needed at the academies and recommend that the Secretary of Defense evaluate alternative means of providing oversight and advice to the academies. OSD partially concurred with the recommendations and stated that it had begun a standardized cost reporting and graduate evaluation, and would continue to monitor the academies and other commissioning programs with a view towards achieving optimum efficiency.

Other Reviews

The Director, Accession Policy, Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense (Force Management Policy) contracted with the American Council on Education Center for Adult Learning and Educational Credentials to assess the three Military Department academies' Prep Schools. The results of the assessment were issued in a report, "Service Academy Preparatory Schools Project," May 6, 1993. The report states that:

o the mission of the Prep Schools needs to be clarified;

o the academic budgets and facilities of the schools should be adequate to provide instructional and student services, if necessary, at the expense of athletic and military training programs;

o faculty members should have degrees in their assigned subject areas, effective teacher training, and teaching experience; and

o athletic and military training programs should complement the academic program and not be allowed to detract from the academic development of each student.

The report recommends that the Prep Schools be either significantly reformed or abolished. Reforms include changes in the mission of each school, admissions and retention improvements, cost reductions, and program changes.

As a result of the OSD contracted assessment of the Military Department academies' Prep Schools and a December 1993 internal staffing study conducted by the Prep School, the Prep School Commander determined that a ". . . few [civilian] instructors with more subject area expertise would help reduce the workload on the other instructors." The Commander determined that the academic staff was averaging 55-hour work weeks and were spending a great deal of time preparing for classes. Additionally, course directors were spending excessive time preparing course syllabi and tests.

To increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the Prep School, thus reducing the instructors' average work week, the Commander recommended that seven positions be converted from military instructors to civilian instructors. The English Department and the Science Department would phase in two civilian instructors, and the Mathematics Department would phase in three civilian instructors. The goal of the Prep School is to place a civilian instructor, who has the proper credentials, as the head of each of the three academic departments and as one or two other subject area experts. Implementation of the civilian positions would be phased in over a 5-year period, starting in the third quarter of FY 1995. The conversion of the positions will take place through the normal rotation of the military personnel occupying the positions. The Prep School has already converted the military position of senior military training advisor to a civilian instructor position in the English Department. The position is an instructor and the course director for reading comprehension.

As of October 31, 1994, the Superintendent, U.S. Air Force Academy had approved the conversion of six military positions to civilian positions. The proposed conversions had not been presented to Air Force Headquarters when the Superintendent requested that the Inspector General, DoD, review the proposal as part of an ongoing audit.

Appendix D. Positions Identified for Conversion

Department	Position Number	Military Grade	Position Title
English	18424	Enlisted-7	English Instructor
Mathematics	0872	Officer-4	Academic Program Manager (Head, Mathematics Department)
Mathematics	1467	Officer-3	Math Instructor
Mathematics	17667	Enlisted-7	Math Instructor
Science	15332	Officer-4	Academic Program Manager (Head, Science Department)
Science	15329	Officer-3	Science Instructor
Administration	17644	Enlisted-7	Communication Computer System Programmer Craftsman (Chief, Computer Information Services)
Athletics	12826	Enlisted-6	Physical Therapy Craftsman (Athletic Trainer)
Commander	12843	Officer-3	Academic Program Manager (Director of Counseling and Study Development)

Appendix E. Positions Identified for Future Consideration

Department	Position Number	Military Grade	Position Title	Action
Academics	19905	Officer-5	Academic Program Manager (Academic Dean)	Reconsider after faculty civilian conversions occur.
English	18326	Enlisted-7	English Instructor	Reconsider after English Department faculty course director civilian conversions occur.
Mathematics	*	*	Mathematics Instructor	Reconsider after Mathematics Department faculty instructor and civilian conversions occur.

* Includes all remaining military positions.

Appendix F. Positions Identified for Other Actions

Department	Position Number	Military Grade	Position Title	Action
English	12805	Officer-3	Instructor (Executive Officer)	Realign duties and responsibilities under a position of senior military technical advisor.
English	12822	Officer-4	Academic Program Manager (Head, English Department)	Reclassify as instructor and downgrade to an Officer-3.
Mathematics	01198	Officer-3	Instructor (Executive Officer)	Realign duties and responsibilities under a position of senior military technical advisor.
Science	15330	Officer-3	Instructor (Executive Officer)	Realign duties and responsibilities under a position of senior military technical advisor.

Appendix G. Potential Monetary Benefits of Conversions

Military Grade	Civilian Grade Equivalent[1]	Military Compensation (Base Year)[2]	Civilian Compensation (Base Year)[2]	Number to be Converted	Total Military Compensation	Total Civilian Compensation	Benefit of Conversion (1 year)	Benefit of Conversion (6 years)[3]
Officer-4	GS-13	$87,997	$69,465	3[4]	175,994	$138,930	$ 37,064	$222,384
Officer-3	GS-12	$71,554	$58,416	3	214,662	175,248	39,414	236,484
Enlisted-7	GS-07	$49,452	$32,930	3	148,356	98,790	49,566	297,396
Enlisted-6	GS-06	$43,485	$29,633	1	43,485	29,633	13,852	83,112
				10	$582,497	$442,601	$156,339[4]	$938,034[4]

[1] We did not use the exact equivalent for each military pay grade. Instead, we used the next higher civilian pay grade for enlisted positions to allow for the overtime or additional staffing that may be needed as a result of the conversion from military to civilian positions.
[2] Our estimate of potential monetary benefits is based on fiscal year 1995 Military-Civilian Equivalent Pay Rates for the Air Force, published by the Comptroller of the Department of Defense, to support Defense Business Operations Fund budget formulation.
[3] Fiscal Year 1996 through fiscal year 2001 Future Years Defense Program.
[4] Included in the total number of conversions under the Military Grade of Officer-4 is one position to be downgraded to an Officer-3. The difference in military compensation from an Officer-4 to an Officer-3 is $16,443 for 1 year and $96,658 for 6 years. The $16,443 and $98,658 have been included in the total benefit of conversion for 1 year and 6 years respectively.

Appendix H. Summary of Potential Benefits Resulting From Audit

Recommendation Reference	Description of Benefit	Amount and/or Type of Benefit
1.	Economy and Efficiency. Converting the positions will allow for the reassignment of military personnel to more essential functions within the Air Force.	Funds put to better use of $156,339 annually or $938,034 during the execution of the FY 1996 through FY 2001 Future Years Defense Program. Appropriations: 57X3500 - Military Personnel, Air Force, and 57X3400 - Operation and Maintenance, Air Force.
2.	Economy and Efficiency. The realignment of three personnel actions will enhance the operation of the Preparatory School.	Nonmonetary.
3.	Economy and Efficiency. The increased civilian end-strength authorizations and payroll authority will enhance the operation of the Preparatory School.	Nonmonetary.
4.	Economy and Efficiency. The possibility of converting the positions would allow for the reassignment of military personnel to more essential functions within the Air Force.	Undeterminable.*

* Upon implementation of the recommendations, the Air Force will be able to determine the monetary benefits.

Appendix I. Organizations Visited or Contacted

Office of the Secretary of Defense

Under Secretary of Defense (Personnel and Readiness), Arlington, VA

Department of the Air Force

U.S. Air Force Academy, Colorado Springs, CO
U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School, Colorado Springs, CO

Appendix J. Report Distribution

Office of the Secretary of Defense

Under Secretary of Defense (Comptroller)
Under Secretary of Defense (Personnel and Readiness)
Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Acquisition Reform)
Assistant to the Secretary of Defense (Public Affairs)

Department of the Army

Auditor General, Department of the Army

Department of the Navy

Auditor General, Department of the Navy

Department of the Air Force

Secretary of the Air Force
Assistant Secretary of the Air Force (Financial Management and Comptroller)
Superintendent, U.S. Air Force Academy
Commander, U.S. Air Force Academy Preparatory School
Auditor General, Department of the Air Force

Defense Organizations

Director, Defense Contract Audit Agency
Director, Defense Logistics Agency
Director, National Security Agency
Inspector General, Central Imagery Office
Inspector General, Defense Intelligence Agency
Inspector General, National Security Agency
Director, Defense Logistics Studies Information Exchange

Non-Defense Federal Organizations and Individuals

Office of Management and Budget
Technical Information Center, National Security and International Affairs Division, General Accounting Office

Chairman and Ranking Minority Member of Each of the Following Congressional Committees and Subcommittees:

- Senate Committee on Appropriations
- Senate Subcommittee on Defense, Committee on Appropriations
- Senate Committee on Armed Services
- Senate Subcommittee on Personnel, Committee on Armed Services
- Senate Committee on Governmental Affairs
- House Committee on Appropriations
- House Subcommittee on National Security, Committee on Appropriations
- House Committee on Government Reform and Oversight
- House Subcommittee on National Security, International Affairs, and Criminal Justice, Committee on Government Reform and Oversight
- House Committee on National Security

Part IV - Management Comments

Department of the Air Force Comments

Final Report Reference

DEPARTMENT OF THE AIR FORCE
HEADQUARTERS UNITED STATES AIR FORCE
WASHINGTON DC

23 DEC 1994

MEMORANDUM FOR ASSISTANT INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR AUDITING
OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL
DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE

FROM: HQ USAF/DP
1040 Air Force Pentagon
Washington DC 20330-1040

SUBJECT: DoDIG Draft Audit Report, Quick-Reaction Report on the Audit of the US Air Force Preparatory School, (Project No. 4RA-5051)

This is in reply to your memorandum requesting the Assistant Secretary of the Air Force (Financial Management and Comptroller) to provide Air Force comments on subject report.

Recommendation 1. Reclassify the nine military positions listed in Appendix D as civilian positions on the US Air Force Academy Unit Manpower Document.

Response. Partially concur. Concur that nine positions can be converted from military to civilian positions; however, do not concur with the specific positions/grade authorizations as identified in draft report. The following are our areas of disagreement and proposed changes to the report:

Pages 6 and 7

Page 7, Academic Dean. Disagree that the duties of the Vice Commander could be effectively realigned under the military training division. The military training division is typically headed by a captain. Although the individuals selected for this position are excellent performers, we do not believe that a captain has the maturity and breadth of experience to be the decision making authority when the Commander is not available. Additionally, as you observed during your audit of the Prep School, everyone performs multiple duties across all areas of the curriculum--academics, military training, athletics, and character development. Therefore, it is important that the Academic Dean/Vice Commander, as the number two person at the Prep School, have expertise and credibility in all these areas. This requires the Dean to be a military member.

Page 7

Page 7, English Department, lines 5 & 6. Request you insert the word, "enlisted", in both lines: line 5, ...hiring qualified enlisted military personnel...; line 6, ...for an enlisted English position. The Prep School has not had any difficulty hiring qualified officer personnel. Because Air Force enlisted personnel are not required to have college degrees, the majority do not, especially English degrees, which severely restricts the enlisted pool of potential English instructor candidates.

Page 7

Pages 7 & 8, Conversion. Conversion of the English Department Head from military to civilian is one of the actions previously identified by the Prep School Commander. However, to also eliminate the difficulty in hiring enlisted English instructors, the Prep School plans to convert one of the E-7 enlisted authorizations

Final Report Reference

and retain the officer authorization. The officer authorization will be downgraded from 0-4 to an 0-3. This provides the benefit of the more highly qualified civilian in the department head position and eliminates the difficulty in finding a second qualified enlisted English instructor.

English Department Changes:

Position	18424	Enlisted - 7	convert to civilian
Position	12822	Officer - 4	convert to Officer - 3

Pages 8 and 9

Page 9, Mathematics Department Conversions. The math instructor conversions were also identified by the Prep School Commander. However, since your audit, the Prep School Commander has become aware of a weakness with the enlisted math instructors. Specifically, only two of the last five enlisted mathematics instructors have been able to teach the entire math curriculum. Due to their qualifications and abilities, the other three enlisted instructors did not teach classes during certain terms increasing the workload of the officer instructors. Therefore, our plan is for one of the three math instructor conversions to be an E-7 enlisted position instead of an 0-3 officer.

Mathematics Department Changes:

Position	00852	Officer - 3	retain as Officer - 3
Position	17667	Enlisted - 7	convert to civilian

Recommendation 2. Realign the duties and responsibilities of the three positions listed in Appendix F on the US Air Force Academy Unit Manpower Document.

Response. Concur. Action will be completed by September 30, 1998.

Recommendation 3. Obtain increased civilian end-strength authorizations and civilian payroll authority to reclassify the nine military positions to civilian positions in Recommendation 1.

Response. Concur. Action will be completed by October 1, 1996.

Recommendation 4. Reevaluate the requirement for military personnel as the academic deans in the English Department and in the Mathematics Department after full implementation of Recommendation 1.

Response. We are in the process of converting 25 percent of Academy's faculty positions to civilian positions. We plan to pause in the year 2000 and review the remaining military positions to see if any additional conversions are appropriate. Because of the relatively small size (38 authorizations) involved across the curriculum- - this review will not only look at positions within departments, but will look at the school-wide impact of conversions. This becomes especially critical when civilians can only work 40 hours per week without being paid overtime.

Because all the conversions identified in the draft report will occur upon departure of the incumbents, exact timing is not available. Additionally, the specific civilian grades will not be known until implementation of the conversions. Therefore, we cannot quantify the potential monetary benefits at this time.

The action officer for the audit is Captain Sam Montgomery at (703) 697-8917. Please feel free to contact him if you have any questions.

ANDREW J. PELAK, JR.
Brigadier General, USAF
Acting Deputy Chief of Staff, Personnel

Audit Team Members

This report was prepared by the Readiness and Operational Support Directorate, Office of the Assistant Inspector General for Auditing, Department of Defense.

Thomas F. Gimble
Harlan M. Geyer
Richard A. Brown
Jean M. Jackson
William T. LaBeau
Harriet E. Lambert
Nancy C. Cipolla